(1)

F.No.89-270/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 2/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Bhartiyam College of Education, Village Panhera Khurd, Ballabgarh, Faridabad, Haryana dated 02/05/2016 is against the decision of the Northern Regional Committee contained in the minutes of their 252nd meeting held from 19th April to 2nd May, 2016 to refuse recognition for conducting B.A. B.Ed./B.Sc. B.Ed. course on the grounds that "The institution has not submitted any reply of the show cause notice issued on 25/02/2016 by the NRC, NCTE. The N.R.C. issued their refusal order no. NRC/NCTE/NRCAPP-11038/252nd (Part-2) Meeting/2016/153162-65 on 11.07.2016."

AND WHEREAS Aggrieved by the decision of the N.R.C. to refuse recognition on the ground that the institution has not submitted any reply of the show cause notice issued on 25.02.2016, the appellant filed a Writ Petition W. P. (C) 3582/2016 before the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi at New Delhi. The Hon'ble High Court in their order dt. 29.04.2016, holding that the petitioners have an alternative effective remedy by way of an appeal and the issues are disputed question of fact, dismissed the petition with liberty to petitioners to avail of the alternate effective remedy in accordance with law. The Hon'ble High Court also directed that as and when the appeals are fited by the petitioners, the same would be taken up by respondent no. 1 (NCTE) in its next meeting.

AND WHEREAS Sh. Gian Bhardwaj, President and Ms. Sarita Bhardwaj, Secretary, Bhartiyam College of Education, Village Panhera Khurd, Ballabgarh, Faridabad, Haryana presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that while the formal show cause has not been received till date, they submitted their reply on 24.02.2016, after noting the decision from the website of the NCTE and therefore, there is no need to go into the question of receipt of formal show cause notice dt. 25.02.2016. The N.R.C. has rejected their application on the ground that the

institution has not submitted a reply to the show cause notice. The appellant further submitted that their reply dt. 24.02.2016 was sent by speed post and enclosed a copy of their letter dt. 24.02.2016 (without its enclosures) bearing speed post stamp receipt no. EH738455249IN dt. 24.02.2016.

AND WHEREAS the Committee, noted that from the file of the N.R.C. that the show cause notice dt. 25.02.2016 was not returned undelivered and the stated reply of the appellant dt. 24.02.2016 is also not in that file. Since the appellant has shown proof of despatch of his letter dt. 24.02.2016, the Committee concluded that the matter deserved to be remanded to the NRC with a direction to consider the reply of the appellant dated 24.02.2016 and take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant is directed to send a copy of his letter dt. 24.02.2016 with all its enclosures to the N.R.C. within 15 days of issue of the orders on the appeal.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to NRC with a direction to consider the reply of the appellant dated 24.02.2016 and take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant is directed to send a copy of his letter dt. 24.02.2016 with all its enclosures to the N.R.C. within 15 days of issue of the orders on the appeal.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Bhartiyam College of Education, Village Panhera Khurd, Ballabgarh, Faridabad, Haryana to the NRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The President, Bhartiyam College of Education, Plot No.0, Street No.0, Village-Panhera Khurd, PO-Ballabhgarh, Tehsil/Taluka-Ballabhgarh, Town/City – Faridabad – 121004, Haryana.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Northern Regional Committee, Fourth Floor, Jeevan Nidhi-II, LIC Building, Bhawani Singh Marg, Ambedkar Circle, Jaipur - 302005, Rajasthan.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Haryana, Chandigarh.

(2)

F.No.89-271/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 2/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Bhartiyam College of Education, Village Panhera Khurd, Ballabgarh, Faridabad, Haryana dated 02/05/2016 is against the decision of the Northern Regional Committee contained in the minutes of their 252nd meeting held from 19th April to 2nd May, 2016 to refuse recognition for conducting M.Ed. course on the grounds that "The applicant institution has remitted a DD No. 884196 dt. 19/03/2016 for Rs. 1,50,000/- issued by Punjab & Sind Bank which was received in NRC office on 21/03/2016 which is not acceptable as the processing fee of Rs. 1,50,000/- has not been submitted alongwith on-line application. Hence application rejected, file be closed. The N.R.C. issued their refusal order F.No. NRC/NRC APP-11078/252nd (Part – 2) Meeting/ 2016/153170-73 on 11.07.2016."

AND WHEREAS Aggrieved by the decision of the N.R.C. to refuse recognition on the ground that the applicant has not submitted the processing fee of Rs. 150000/- alongwith the online application (dt. 28.05.2015) but submitted a Demand Draft dated 19.03.2016 later, the appellant filed a Writ Petition W.P. (C) 3581/2016 before the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi at New Delhi. The Hon'ble High Court, in their order dt. 29.04.2016, holding that the petitioners have an alternative remedy by way of an appeal and the issues are disputed questions of fact, dismissed the petition with liberty to petitioners to avail of the alternative effective remedy in accordance with law. The Hon'ble High Court also directed that as and when the appeals are filed by the petitioners, the same would be taken up by the respondent no. 1 (NCTE) in its next meeting.

AND WHEREAS Sh. Gian Bhardwaj, President and Ms. Sarita Bhardwaj, Secretary, Bhartiyam College of Education, Village Panhera Khurd, Ballabgarh, Faridabad, Haryana presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that (i) the

application for grant of recognition for M.Ed. course was submitted online on 28.05.2015 and the hard copies of the same were submitted on 03.06.2015; (ii) along with the application the processing fee of Rs. 150000/- was paid by way Demand Draft No. 883389 dt. 28.05.2015 drawn on Punjab and Sind Bank, Faridabad, Haryana; (ii) in the covering letter of the hard copy of the application submitted to N.R.C. on 03.06.2015, copy of bank draft has been mentioned and enclosed and as per practice N.R.C. receives such applications only after verifying the payment of processing fee and therefore it appears that the demand draft duly submitted by the appellant has been lost by the N.R.C.; (iv) on receipt of the show cause notice, the appellant, reiterating that copies of the demand draft dt. 28.05.2015 and Challan for payment were submitted with the hard copy of the application, submitted a fresh Demand Draft dt. 19.03.2016 for Rs. 1,50,000/-; (v) as a precaution against any misuse they have requested the Punjab and Sind Bank, Faridabad to cancel the Demand Draft dt. 28.05.2015 and not to encash the same if presented by somebody; (vi) N.R.C. considered the case of the appellant for the first time after delay of about seven months and issued the show cause notice on 24.02.2016 and (vii) as per the schedule fixed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in Maa Vaishno Devi Mahila Mahavidyalaya case N.R.C. was required to communicate the deficiency within 30 days of receipt of the application.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant himself admitted that alongwith the hard copy of the application only copies of the Challan and the Demand Draft for Rs. 1,50,000/- were submitted. The appellant made the same statement in his reply to the show cause notice also. This proves that as the appellant did not submit the original Demand Draft for Rs. 1,50,000/- towards the processing fee to the N.R.C. the allegation that it has been lost by the N.R.C. has no basis. Further, at the request of the Council, Bank of India, the bankers for the Council, certified that they find no details of the Demand Draft No. 883389 dt. 28.05.2015 for Rs. 1,50,000/- issued by Punjab & Sind Bank, Faridabad in the account. The Committee also noted that in the NCTE Regulations, 2014 there is no provision for issue of any letter pointing out deficiencies and the N.R.C, issued a Show Cause Notice, only to enable the appellant to make a representation before a decision is taken by the Committee.

AND WHEREAS in view of the foregoing position the Committee concluded that the N.R.C. was justified in refusing recognition and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the N.R.C. confirmed.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the memorandum of appeal, affidavit, the documents available on records and considering the oral arguments advanced during the hearing, the Committee concluded that the NRC was justified in refusing recognition and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the NRC is confirmed.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby confirms the Order appealed against.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The President, Bhartiyam College of Education, Plot No.0, Street No.0, Village-Panhera Khurd, PO-Ballabhgarh, Tehsil/Taluka-Ballabhgarh, Town/City – Faridabad – 121004, Haryana.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Northern Regional Committee, Fourth Floor, Jeevan Nidhi-II, LIC Building, Bhawani Singh Marg, Ambedkar Circle, Jaipur - 302005, Rajasthan.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Haryana, Chandigarh.

3

F.No.89-328/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education, Katul, Bankura, West Bengal dated 31.05.2016 is against the decision of the Eastern Regional Committee, Bhubaneswar contained in the minutes of their 214th meeting held on 13-15 May, 2016 to refuse recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the ground that in their 212nd meeting held on 19-20 April, 2016 it was decided to issue a show cause notice to the institution on the grounds that "(i) in the building plan, total land area has been written by hand without countersignature by the approving authority i.e. Assistant Engineer; and (ii) as per online application, name of the institution is 'Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education' whereas land is in the name of 'Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education (B.Ed. & D.El.Ed. in composite form)' i.e. in different name. The reply of the institution submitted on 23.04.2016 on the basis of the proceedings uploaded in the E.R.C. website cannot be considered. E.R.C. issued their refusal order no. ER/7-214.7.16/ERCAPP3341/2016/47385 on 20.06.2016."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Asim Biswas, Secretary, Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education, Katul, Bankura, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "in the sanctioned Building plan, where the total land area was written by hand unfortunately and mistakenly has been rectified with the counter signature of the approving authority.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant in reply to the show cause notice submitted to the ERC, inter-alia a rectified building plan in which land area written in hand has been countersigned by the Asstt. Engineer, Khatra Division, Bankura and a sworn affidavit stating that in the sale deed (dt. 29.05.2015) the name of the Vendee institution has been mistakenly written as Prodyumna

Institute of Higher Education (B.Ed. and D.El.Ed. in a composite form) to mean and match with NCTE Regulations, 2014 as it was not fully clear to them about the formation of composite institution. It was also stated that in all other documents such as mutation certificate, conversion certificate, Land Use Certificate and building completion certificate the name of their institution has been mentioned as Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education. The appellant, with his appeal, forwarded a copy of Deed of Rectification and Declaration executed by the vendor and the vendee and got registered in the office of the Addl. Distt. Sub-Registrar, Bishnupur, Bankura on 04.05.2016 declaring that the land schedule to the sale deed dt. 29.05.2015 should be in the name of Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education instead of Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education (B.Ed., D.El.Ed. in composite form) and the Deed of Declaration is part and parcel of the original deed no. 010301089 for the year 2015.

AND WHEREAS the Committee, concluded that the submissions of the appellant deserved to be accepted and matter remanded to the E.R.C. with a direction to process the application further as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. with a direction to process the application further as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education, Katul, Bankura, West Bengal to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education, 513, College, 389, Katul, Bankura, West Bengal – 722138.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

F.No.89-329/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education, Katul, Bankura, West Bengal dated 01/06/2016 is against the decision of the Eastern Regional Committee, Bhubaneswar contained in the minutes of their 214th Meeting held on 13-15 May, 2016 to refuse recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the ground that in their 212nd meeting held on 19-20 April, 2016 it was decided to issue a show cause notice to the institution on the grounds that (i) in the building plan, total land area has been written by hand without countersignature by the approving authority i.e. Assistant Engineer; and (ii) as per online application, name of the institution is 'Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education' whereas land is in the name of 'Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education (B.Ed. & D.El.Ed. in composite form)' i.e. in different name. The reply of the institution submitted on 23.04.2016 on the basis of the proceedings uploaded in the E.R.C. website cannot be considered. E.R.C. issued their refusal order no. ER/7-214.7.15/ERCAPP3342/D.El.Ed./2016/47340 on 20.06.2016.

AND WHEREAS Sh. Asim Biswas, Secretary, Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education, Katul, Bankura, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that in the sanctioned Building plan, where the total land area was written by hand unfortunately and mistakenly has been rectified with the counter signature of the approving authority.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant in reply to the show cause notice submitted to the ERC, inter-alia a rectified building plan in which land area written in hand has been countersigned by the Asstt. Engineer, Khatra Division, Bankura and a sworn affidavit stating that in the sale deed (dt. 29.05.2015) the name of the Vendee institution has been mistakenly written as Prodyumna

Institute of Higher Education (B.Ed. and D.El.Ed. in a composite form) to mean and match with NCTE Regulations, 2014 as it was not fully clear to them about the formation of composite institution. It was also stated that in all other documents such as mutation certificate, conversion certificate, Land Use Certificate and building completion certificate the name of their institution has been mentioned as Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education. The appellant, with his appeal, forwarded a copy of Deed of Rectification and Declaration executed by the vendor and the vendee and got registered in the office of the Addl. Distt. Sub-Registrar, Bishnupur, Bankura on 04.05.2016 declaring that the land schedule to the sale deed dt. 29.05.2015 should be in the name of Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education instead of Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education (B.Ed., D.El.Ed. in composite form) and the Deed of Declaration is part and parcel of the original deed no. 010301089 for the year 2015.

AND WHEREAS the Committee, concluded that the submissions of the appellant deserved to be accepted and matter remanded to the E.R.C. with a direction to process the application further as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. with a direction to process the application further as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education, Katul, Bankura, West Bengal to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Prodyumna Institute of Higher Education, 513, College, 389, Katul, Bankura, West Bengal – 722138.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

5

F.No.89-330/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Kuntala Das College of Education, Howrah, West Bengal dated 01/06/2016 is against the Order No. ERC/7-202.9(i).331/ERCAPP3458/B.Ed.(Addl. Course)/2015/42611 dated 09/02/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, summarily rejecting their application for grant of recognition for conducting B.Ed. Additional Course on the ground that "copy of the registered land document not submitted with hard copy of the print out of online application. In view of the above the Committee decided as under: The application of institution is summarily rejected as per clause 7(2)(b) of NCTE Regulation 2014."

AND WHEREAS aggrieved by the order of the E.R.C., the appellant filed a Writ Petition No. W.P. 8429 (W) of 2016 before the Hon'ble High Court of Calcutta. The Hon'ble High Court in their order dated 10.05.2016 disposed of the petition holding that there is a statutory alternative remedy available to the petitioners and this order will not prevent the petitioner from availing of the statutory remedy available to them. The appellant thereafter filed the present appeal on 1.06.2016.

AND WHEREAS Sh. Bishnu Pada Das, Secretary, Kuntala Das College of Education, Howrah, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that (i) the delay in submitting the registered land document before NCTE was unforeseen and solely because of law and order problem in the area where the college is situated; (ii) in spite of best endeavour the petitioner failed to take possession of the said land and execute the deed in connection with the same in time due to the constant threat and illegal activities of the local club members; and (iii) under such circumstances he was constrained to arrange alternative land but the difficulties faced by the petitioner were not considered by the NCTE. With the appeal inter-alia

the appellant enclosed a copy of the Gift deed dt. 18.04.2016 between Birendra Kumar Das College of Education and the appellant's college.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that according to the provisions of Clause 7(2) (b) of the NCTE Regulations, 2014 failure to submit print out of the applications made online alongwith the land documents as required under sub-regulation (4) of Regulation 5 i.e. registered land document issued by the competent authority indicating that the society or institution applying for the programme possesses land on the date of application, shall result in summary rejection. Since the appellant did not submit a copy of the registered land document with the hard copy of the print out of the application, which is mandatory and he has admitted this in his appeal, the Committee concluded that the E.R.C. was justified in rejecting the application and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the E.R.C. confirmed.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the memorandum of appeal, affidavit, the documents available on records and considering the oral arguments advanced during the hearing, the Committee concluded that the ERC was justified in refusing recognition and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the ERC is confirmed.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby confirms the Order appealed against.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Kuntala Das College of Education, 4299, 4302, 4708, Basukati, Howrah, West Bengal – 711227.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

(6)

F.No.89-321/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Surendralal Das Teachers Training College, Howhra, West Bengal dated 01/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER/7-202.9(i).328/ERCAPP4272/B.Ed(Addl.Intake)/2015/42613 dated 09/02/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, summarily rejecting their application for grant of recognition for conducting B.Ed. course (Additional intake) on the ground that "copy of the registered land document not submitted with hard copy of the print out of online application. In view of the above the Committee decided as under: The application of the institution is summarily rejected as per clause 7(2)(b) of NCTE Regulation 2014."

AND WHEREAS aggrieved by the order of the ERC, the appellant filed a Writ Petition No. WP 8431 (W) of 2016 before the Hon'ble High Court of Calcutta. The Hon'ble High Court in their order dt. 10.05.2016 disposed of the petition holding that there is statutory alternative remedy available to the petitioners and this order will not prevent the petitioner from availing the statutory remedy available to them. The appellant thereafter filed the present appeal on 1.06.2010.

AND WHEREAS Sh. Bishnu Pada Das, Secretary, Surendralal Das Teachers Training College, Howhra, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that (i) the delay in submitting the registered land document before NCTE was unforeseen and solely because of law and order problem in the area where the college is situated; (ii) in spite of best endeavour the petitioner failed to take possession of the said land and execute the deed in connection with the same in time due to the constant threat and illegal activities of the local club members; and (iii) under such circumstances he was constrained to arrange alternative land but the difficulties faced by the petitioner were not considered by the NCTE. With the

appeal, the appellant inter-alia closed a copy of the gift deed dated 18.04.2016 between one Shri Bishnu Pada Das and the appellant College.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that according to the provisions of Clause 7(2) (b) of the NCTE Regulations, 2014 failure to submit print out of the applications made online alongwith the land documents as required under sub-regulation (4) of Regulation 5 i.e. registered land document issued by the competent authority indicating that the society or institution applying for the programme possesses land on the date of application, shall result in summary rejection. Since the appellant did not submit a copy of the registered land document with the hard copy of the print out of the application, which is mandatory and he has admitted this in his appeal, the Committee concluded that the E.R.C. was justified in rejecting the application and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the E.R.C. confirmed.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the memorandum of appeal, affidavit, the documents available on records and considering the oral arguments advanced during the hearing, the Committee concluded that the ERC was justified in refusing recognition and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the ERC is confirmed.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby confirms the Order appealed against.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Surendralal Das Teachers Training College, 5007, 5008P, 5505, 5516, 4300, 4301, Anand Nagar, Howrah, West Bengal – 711227.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

(8)

F.No.89-333/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of J.B. Memorial College of Education, Jhargram, Midnapore, West Bengal dated 04/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER/7-206.8.7/ERCAPP3401/(D.El.Ed.)/2016/44461 dated 03/03/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the grounds that "a. Show cause notice was issued on 11/02/2016 on the ground that the land documents (land deed) are in the name of Debiyoti Ghosh the Secretary J.B. Memorial College of Education i.e. in the name of individual, which is not acceptable as per NCTE Regulation 2014.b. Reply dated 10/02/2016 submitted by the institution on the basis of proceedings uploaded in the website of ERC, NCTE is not satisfactory. In view of the above, the Committee decided as under: The Committee is of the opinion that the application bearing Code No. ERCAPP3401 of the institution regarding recognition for D.El.Ed. is refused under section 14(3)(b) of NCTE Act 1993."

AND WHEREAS the submission of the appeal has been delayed by one month and two days beyond the prescribed time limit of 60 days. The appellant, in his letter dt. 22.07.2016, submitted that after seeing the refusal decision on the website, they sent a letter to E.R.C on 15.03.2016 for the refusal order to file an appeal and wrote another letter on 31.03.2016 informing them that the letter was returned undelivered due to negligence of post office. In that letter they requested for re-sending the order. The appellant also submitted that as the refusal order was still not sent by E.R.C. they wrote again on 15.04.2016 and 29.04.2016 and also visited the E.R.C. office and after further efforts they collected a copy of the order from E.R.C. office on 30.05.2016. The appellant enclosed copies of all the letters

written to E.R.C. In view of these submissions of the appellant, the Committee decided to condone the delay and consider the appeal.

AND WHEREAS Sh. Joyanta Ghosh, Chairman and Ms. Debijyoti Ghosh, Secretary, J.B. Memorial College of Education, Jhargram, Midnapore, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "the land documents has been converted in the name of institution i.e. through Declaration Deed."

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant, in reply to the decision to issue show cause notice, sent a letter dated 10.02.2016 to the E.R.C. In that letter the appellant submitted that (i) the land documents are in the favour of the Secretary, J.B. Memorial College of Education and not in favour of individual (Debijyoti Ghosh) and his name appeared only as Secretary; and (ii) the land records, namely, tax receipts issued by the Land and Land Reforms Department, Government of West Bengal; Land Conversion Certificate issued from Sub-Divisional Land and Land Reforms office, Jhargram, Government of West Bengal; and building plan sanctioned by Bishnupur Gram Panchayat are in favour of Secretary, J.B. Memorial College of Education, The appellant with his appeal besides, enclosing copies of all the relevant documents in support of their claim that the land is in the name of the institution, enclosed copies of two Deeds of declaration dated 23.02.2016, in respect of the two Gift Deeds dated 13.03.2015 and 13.04.2015, executed and got registered in the office of the District Sub-Registrar, Medinipur. These Deeds of Declaration clarified that these are part of the original gift deeds and the Donee in the two gift deeds is J.B. Memorial College of Education and its Secretary is mere acceptors of the gifted land on behalf of the said college.

AND WHEREAS the Committee, in view of the above position, concluded that the submission of the appellant deserved to be accepted and the matter remanded to the E.R.C. to process the application further as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal

Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. to process the application further as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of J.B. Memorial College of Education, Jhargram, Midnapore, West Bengal to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Chairman, J.B. Memorial College of Education, 1226/1838, 1226/1839, 1226/1840, Deed of Gift, 1226, Kui, Jhargram, Midnapore, West Bengal-721514.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

(9)

F.No.89-334/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of J.B. Memorial College of Education, Jhargram, Midnapore, West Bengal dated 04/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER/7-206.8.6/ERCAPP3402/(B.Ed.)/2016/44460 dated 03/03/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the ground that "a. Show cause notice was issued on 11/02/2016 on the ground that the land documents (land deed) are in the name of Debiyoti Ghosh the Secretary J.B. Memorial College of Education i.e. in the name of individual, which is not acceptable as per NCTE Regulation 2014. b. Reply dated 10/02/2016 submitted by the institution on the basis of proceedings uploaded in the website of ERC, NCTE is not satisfactory. In view of the above, the Committee decided as under: The Committee is of the opinion that the application bearing Code No. ERCAPP3402 of the institution regarding recognition for B.Ed. is refused under section 14(3)(b) of NCTE Act 1993."

AND WHEREAS the submission of the appeal has been delayed by one month and two days beyond the prescribed time limit of 60 days. The appellant, in his letter dt. 22.07.2016, submitted that after seeing the refusal decision on the website, they sent a letter to E.R.C on 15.03.2016 for the refusal order to file an appeal and wrote another letter on 31.03.2016 informing them that the letter was returned undelivered due to negligence of post office. In that letter they requested for re-sending the order. The appellant also submitted that as the refusal order was still not sent by E.R.C. they wrote again on 15.04.2016 and 29.04.2016 and also visited the E.R.C. office and after further efforts they collected a copy of the order from E.R.C. office on 30.05.2016. The appellant enclosed copies of all the letters

written to E.R.C. In view of these submissions of the appellant, the Committee decided to condone the delay and consider the appeal.

AND WHEREAS Sh. Joyanta Ghosh, Chairman and Ms. Debijyoti Ghosh, Secretary, J.B. Memorial College of Education, Jhargram, Midnapore, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "the land documents has been converted in the name of institution through Declaration Deed.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant, in reply to the decision to issue show cause notice, sent a letter dated 10.02.2016 to the E.R.C. In that letter the appellant submitted that (i) the land documents are in the favour of the Secretary, J.B. Memorial College of Education and not in favour of individual (Debijyoti Ghosh) and his name appeared only as Secretary; and (ii) the land records, namely, tax receipts issued by the Land and Land Reforms Department, Government of West Bengal; Land Conversion Certificate issued from Sub-Divisional Land and Land Reforms office, Jhargram, Government of West Bengal; and building plan sanctioned by Bishnupur Gram Panchayat are in favour of Secretary, J.B. Memorial College of Education, The appellant with his appeal besides, enclosing copies of all the relevant documents in support of their claim that the land is in the name of the institution, enclosed copies of two Deeds of declaration dated 23.02.2016, in respect of the two Gift Deeds dated 13.03.2015 and 13.04.2015, executed and got registered in the office of the District Sub-Registrar, Medinipur. These Deeds of Declaration clarified that these are part of the original gift deeds and the Donee in the two gift deeds is J.B. Memorial College of Education and its Secretary is mere acceptors of the gifted land on behalf of the said college.

AND WHEREAS the Committee, in view of the above position, concluded that the submission of the appellant deserved to be accepted and the matter remanded to the E.R.C. to process the application further as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal

Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. to process the application further as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of J.B. Memorial College of Education, Jhargram, Midnapore, West Bengal to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Chairman, J.B. Memorial College of Education, 1226/1838, 1226/1839, 1226/1840, Deed of Gift, 1226, Kui, Jhargram, Midnapore, West Bengal-721514.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

(10)

F.No.89-335/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Jharkhand Teachers Training College (D.Ed.), Jhumari Telaiya, Koderma, Jharkhand dated 12/06/2016 is against the Order No. ERC/7-209.8.43/D.El.Ed./ERCAPP3602/2016/45532 dated 14/04/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. (Additional Course) on the grounds that "1. Show cause notice was issued on 22/02/2016 on the ground that NOC issued from affiliating/examining body not submitted and 2. No reply in response to show cause notice received till date and stipulated time is over. In view of the above, the Committee decided as under: The Committee is of the opinion that application bearing code No. ERCAPP3602 of the institution regarding permission for D.El.Ed. (Addl. Course) is refused under section 15(3)(b) of NCTE Act 1993."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Dharma Nand Mishra, Secretary and Prof. Bipin Bihari Mishra, Society Secretary, Jharkhand Teachers Training College (D.Ed.), Jhumari Telaiya, Koderma, Jharkhand presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation and in a letter dt. 22.07.2016 it was submitted that "the institution had submitted an application to Director, Govt. of Jharkhand on 18th Jan. 2015 for issuance of NOC for D.El.Ed. Course; the State Govt. had forwarded their application to the DEO, Koderma for physical inspection and submission of report; due to non-receipt of reply, the Secretary, Primary Education vide letter dated 21/12/2015 had issued a reminder to the DEOs for submission of the report within one week; in response DEO, Koderma vide letter dated 5th Jan. 2016 had sent a letter to their institution to complete the requisite information and submit to them so that they could conduct physical inspection of their institution and the same was submitted to DEO immediately; the physical inspection of their institution was conducted on 17/02/2016 and the same was sent by DEO to State Government on 05/03/2016; after getting inspection done, the institution vide letters dated 18/02/2016 and 24/02/2016 had requested the State Government to issue the NOC for D.El.Ed.

Course; and the State Govt. on 02/05/2016 had again sent a letter to District School Education officer to conduct physical inspection of their institution and submit the report. The appellant further submitted that despite their best efforts, the State Government had not yet issued the NOC for D.El.Ed. Course and the files are moving from one table to another. It is purely the procedural delay on the part of State Government and there is not any fault of their institution. In response to Show Cause Notice, letter dated 15.3.16 was sent to ERC intimating the factual position and requesting to kindly grant time till the State Government issues the NOC for D.El.Ed. Course. In their letter dt. 22.07.2016, the appellant requested for two more months for submission of the N.O.C.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the reply of the appellant dated 15.03.2016 to the show cause notice is not in the file of the E.R.C. The Committee, however, noted that according to the provisions of Clause 5(3) of the NCTE Regulations, 2014, a No Objection Certificate issued by the concerned affiliating body has to be sent alongwith the application. Since, the appellant did not fulfil this mandatory requirement, the Committee concluded that the E.R.C. was justified in refusing recognition and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the E.R.C. confirmed.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the memorandum of appeal, affidavit, the documents available on records and considering the oral arguments advanced during the hearing, the Committee concluded that the ERC was justified in refusing recognition and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the ERC is confirmed.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby confirms the Order appealed against.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Jharkhand Teachers Training College (D.Ed.) Jhumari Telaiya Koderma, Khata No. 630 Thana 244, own, 3515, Telaiya Basti, Koderma, Jharkhand - 825409.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Jharkhand, Ranchi.

(11)

F.No.89-336/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Gitanjali PTTI, Narasinghapur, Berhampore, Murshidabad, West Bengal dated 08/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER/7-212.6.40/ERCAPP4040/(D.El.Ed.)/2016/46502 dated 02/05/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the grounds that "a. Show cause notice was decided in 210th ERC meeting on the following grounds: (i) As per record available, the name of the recognised institution is "Gitanjali B.Ed. College" and now applied D.El.Ed. Programme in the name of "Gitanjali P.T.T.I." i.e. in different name which comes under the category of standalone institution. b. In response to show cause notice, the institution submitted its reply dated 14/04/2016 on the basis of proceedings uploaded in the website of the ERC. The reply submitted by the institution cannot be considered as per NCTE Regulations 2014. In view of the above, the Committee decided as under: The committee is of the opinion that application bearing code No. ERCAPP4040 of the institution regarding recognition for D.El.Ed. (Additional Course) is refused under section 15(3)(b) of NCTE Act, 1993."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Prosenjit Mandol, President, Gitanjali PTTI, Narasinghapur, Berhampore, Murshidabad, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation and in a letter dt. 09.06.2016 it was submitted that unwittingly they wrote the name of the institution in the application as Gitanjali PTTI; Gitanjali B.Ed. college is recognised by E.R.C., NCTE, Bhubaneswar since 2013 (recognition order dt. 03.02.2013 as per the details given in the application); Narasinghapur Gitanjali Society decided to apply for D.El.Ed. course by name and style of Gitanjali PTTI (Additional Course in a composite mode; there is no option for composite mode nature in the application; Gitanjali B.Ed. College and Gitanjali PTTI is the same institute and Gitanjali PTTI is not a stand alone institution and writing PTTI was a

mistake; they have completed approximately additional 2000 sq. mts. building for the additional D.El.Ed. course; and appointed additional HOD and eight lecturers. The appellant has given an affidavit admitting mistake and stating that Gitanjali B.Ed. College and Gitanjali P.T.T.I. is the same institution.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the Visiting Team that inspected the appellant institution, in their report, noted that there is an existing course of B.Ed. since 2013 and D.El.Ed. applied for is an additional course. The submissions in the appeal and the Visiting Team's report indicate that the appellant is not a stand-alone institution. In these circumstances, the Committee concluded that the matter deserved to be remanded to the E.R.C. with a direction to take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. with a direction to take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Gitanjali PTTI, Narasinghapur, Berhampore, Murshidabad, West Bengal to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The President, Gitanjali PTTI, 531, 535, 288, Gitanjali B.Ed. College, Narasinghapur, Berhampore, Murshidabad, West Bengal – 742306.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

(14)

F.No.89-339/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Sarveshwari Mahavidyalaya, Dhanuha, Allahabad, Uttar Pradesh dated 10/06/2016 is against the Order No. NRC/NCTE/NRCAPP-14588/249th (Part-6) Meeting/2016/149300-03 dated 25/05/2016 of the Northern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.El.Ed. course on the ground that "the institution has not submitted the NOC for B.El.Ed. issued by the affiliating body which is required as per NCTE, Regulations, 2014."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Mukul Singh, Member, Sarveshwari Mahavidyalaya, Dhanuha, Allahabad, Uttar Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "they have submitted NOC for D.El.Ed. Programme because they wanted to apply for D.El.Ed. not for B.El.Ed. but due to typing error it appears B.El.Ed. and they have sent affidavit and other documents related to it. Their application for D.El.Ed. Programme may be considered."

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant, in their online application dt. 29.06.2015 and in their sworn affidavit enclosed to the hard copy of the application mentioned the programme applied for as "B.El.Ed." The appellant, on the other hand, with the hard copy of the application, enclosed a No Objection Certificate issued by the Examination Regulatory Authority, Uttar Pradesh, Allahabad for conducting D.El.Ed. programme. The appellant, in response to the show cause notice dt. 14.10.2015 issued by the N.R.C. pointing out that for B.El.Ed. course applied for, N.O.C. of the affiliating body has not been submitted, in their letter dt. 02.11.2015 stated that they had already sent all the documents. The appellant did not send the N.O.C. for B.El.Ed. course. It is only in their letter dt. 06.02.2016, the appellant informed N.R.C. that in the online application instead of D.El.Ed., B.El.Ed. course was mentioned and therefore, they enclosed N.O.C. for

D.El.Ed. course. The appellant in that letter requested N.R.C. not to treat their application as for B.El.Ed. but treat it as for D.El.Ed. The N.R.C. refused recognition on the ground mentioned in their order.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant throughout his correspondence from the time of online application and upto 06.02.2016 i.e. nearly for seven months, only mentioned the B.El.Ed. programme and the N.R.C. processed their application as for B.El.Ed. only. In these circumstances, the Committee concluded that the N.R.C. was justified in refusing recognition for the applied B.El.Ed. course and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the N.R.C. confirmed.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the memorandum of appeal, affidavit, the documents available on records and considering the oral arguments advanced during the hearing, the Committee concluded that the NRC was justified in refusing recognition and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the NRC is confirmed.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby confirms the Order appealed against.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Manager, Sarveshwari Mahavidylaya, Dhanuha, Chaka, Naini, Allahabad - 211008 Uttar Pradesh.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Northern Regional Committee, Fourth Floor, Jeevan Nidhi-II, LIC Building, Bhawani Singh Marg, Ambedkar Circle, Jaipur - 302005, Rajasthan.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Uttar Pradesh, Lucknow.

(15)

F.No.89-341/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of A.B.V.M. Shiksha Mahavidyalaya, Bhind, Madhya Pradesh dated 07/06/2016 is against the Order No. WRC/APP3550/223/251st/2016/167472 dated 06/05/2016 of the Western Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the grounds that "after perusing the V.T. report and the C.D. a Show Cause Notice was issued to the institution on 29.04.2016, wherein among other points, the institution was asked to explain how two colleges, one 'ABVM Group of Colleges' for the D.El.Ed. course and the second 'ABVM Shiksha Mahavidyalaya' are in the same plot of land. While a reply to the show cause notice was received on 29.04.2016, the society has not given any reply to this show cause point."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Vijay Pal Singh, Secretary, A.B.V.M. Shiksha Mahavidyalaya, Bhind, Madhya Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "(i) Yash Chandra Samaj Kalyan Evam Shiksha Prasar Samiti, Bhind, Madhya Pradesh, in the year 2010 applied for grant of recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course in an institution named ABVM Group of Colleges, Bhind and after following the due process, W.R.C. issued a recognition order on 31.08.2012 and the aforesaid institution is still running D.El.Ed. course; (ii) in order to attain composite status as per the provisions of NCTE Regulations 2014, the Samiti submitted an application for grant of recognition of B.Ed. course; (iii) unfortunately, at the time of filing the application, the course of D.El.Ed. being run was not mentioned, but the fact remains that in the application the same land was offered and the Samiti is the same applicant; (iv) on account of certain reasons, the name of the institution was mentioned as ABVM Shiksha Mahavidyalaya, but the land is the same, building is the same and the institution, which submitted the application is the same; (v) W.R.C., after processing the application issued a show

cause notice dt. 16.02.2016 stating that the institution has applied for B.Ed. course, it is not running any other course and hence it is a stand-alone institution, which is not permitted under the NCTE Regulations, 2014' (vi) the appellant replied in their letter dt. 09.03.2016 mentioning that the institution is already running D.El.Ed. course in the ABVM Group of College in the same premises; (vii) after considering the reply W.R.C. got an inspection of the institution conducted on 23.04.216, which implied that the objection that the institution is not a composite institution was waived; (viii) W.R.C., thereafter, issued another show cause notice dt. 29.04.2016 which was replied on 28.4.2016 on the basis of the minutes the 250th meeting of the W.R.C. held on 27-28 April, 2016; (ix) the point raised in the show cause notice dt. 29.04.2016 regarding running of two institutions on the same plot of land has been clarified in the institutions reply thereto; (x) both the institutions are being run by the same Samiti on the same land at Sy. No. 238/2,339, Sheet NH-12, Village – Bandaupur (Lawan), Gwalior Road, Bhind, Madhya Pradesh in the same building; (xi) The total land area is 4000 sq. mts. and the total built up area is 3026 sq. mts. and the land area and built up area required for D.El.Ed. plus B.Ed. as per NCTE Regulations is 3000 sq. mts. each and hence the area available is enough for both the courses; and (xil) the refusal order has been issued without considering the reply furnished to the show cause notice dt. 29.04.2016."

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant, in reply to W.R.C's first show cause notice wherein the issue of stand-alone institution was raised, while clarifying that the Samiti is conducting D.El.Ed. course in the institution named ABVM Group of College also enclosed a copy of the recognition order dt. 31.08.12 for that course issued by the W.R.C. The W.R.C. thereafter went ahead and conducted an inspection on 23.04.2016. After examining the V.T. report and other documents the W.R.C. issued another show cause notice dt. 29.04.2016 listing various grounds, including the ground that two institutions cannot run on the same land. The appellant besides replying to other grounds has given detailed explanation in respect of this ground also, which has not been considered and the refusal order issued stating that the society has not given any reply to this show cause point. In these circumstances, the Committee concluded that the matter deserved to be remanded to the W.R.C. with a direction to verify the submissions of the appellant about their running the two institutions with different names for

D.El.Ed. and B.Ed. courses by conducting an inspection, on payment, and thereafter, if satisfied that the appellant's institution meets the criteria of a 'composite institution', may take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to W.R.C. with a direction to verify the submissions of the appellant about their running the two institutions with different names for D.El.Ed. and B.Ed. courses by conducting an inspection, on payment, and thereafter, if satisfied that the appellant's institution meets the criteria of a 'composite institution', may take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of A.B.V.M. Shiksha Mahavidyalaya, Bhind, Madhya Pradesh to the WRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, A.B.V.M. Shiksha Mahavidyalaya, 238/2, 339, 0, 238/2, 339, Badanpur (Lawan) Gwalior Road, Bhind, Madhya Pradesh – 477001.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Western Regional Committee, Manas Bhawan, Shayamala Hills, Bhopal - 462002.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Madhya Pradesh, Bhopal.

17

F.No.89-343/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of J.P. Shikshak Prashikshan Mahavidyalaya, Biharsharif, Nalanda, Bihar dated 06/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER-213.6(i).134/APP3034/D.El.Ed.(Addl. Course)/2016/46280 dated 02/05/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, granting recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. (Addl. Course) course with an intake of 50 (One basic unit).

AND WHEREAS Sh. Shailesh Kumar, Secretary and Sh. Purnendu Bhushan, Staff, J.P. Shikshak Prashikshan Mahavidyalaya, Biharsharif, Nalanda, Bihar presented the case of the appellant institution on 22/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that the ERC/NCTE has granted recognition for D.El.Ed. course with an annual intake of 50 students only, whereas they applied for annual intake of 100 students. The appellant requested grant of recognition for two units.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that in the sworn affidavit enclosed to the hard copy of the online application dt. 30.05.2015, the appellant stated that their application is for an intake of 100 students (2 units). The inspection team in their report dt. 16.03.2016, noting that the application is for an additional intake of 100 students (2 units), recommended consideration for grant of recognition for two units (100 students). The E.R.C. after considering the V.T. report in their 210th meeting held on 7-9 April, 2016 decided to issue a Letter of Intent (L.O.I.), which was not issued. The appellant submitted his reply dt. 26.04.2016 to the proposed L.O.I. on the basis of the minutes uploaded on the website. One of the conditions in the proposed L.O.I. is that 'the institution is required to submit the consent/willingness for basic unit (one/two) offering for the said course.' The appellant with his reply dt. 26.04.2016, inter-alia forwarded a sworn affidavit in which it is mentioned that their application is for an intake of 100 and a faculty list comprising of one H.O.D. and 15

lecturers approved by the Bihar School Education Board. This has been noted by the E.R.C. in their examination of the proposal. As per the Norms and Standards for D.El.Ed. course (Appendix – 2 to the NCTE Regulations, 2014), the staff strength required for an intake of upto two basic units of 50 students each is 16 (one HOD and 15 lecturers/teacher). Even though the E.R.C. noted the staff list of 16 submitted by the appellant they granted recognition for one unit (50 students) only, without indicating any reasons for not granting recognition for two units. In these circumstances, the Committee concluded that the matter deserved to be remanded to the E.R.C. with a direction to consider the request of the appellant for grant of recognition for two units of D.El.Ed. course and take necessary action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. with a direction to consider the request of the appellant for grant of recognition for two units of D.El.Ed. course and take necessary action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of J.P. Shikshak Prashikshan Mahavidyalaya, Biharsharif, Nalanda, Bihar to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, J.P. Shikshak Parishishan Mahavidyalaya, 747, 748, 751, 3607, ownership Basis, Biyabani, Biharsharif, Nalanda, Bihar – 803101.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Bihar, Patna.

21

F.No.89-347/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of M.Ed. Vibhag, Ganpat Sahay Post Graduate College, Payagipur, Sadar, Sultanpur, Uttar Pradesh dated 11/06/2016 is against the Order No. NRC/NCTE/NRCAPP-8767/241st Meeting/2015/121087-90 dated 17/08/2015 of the Northern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the ground that "the institution did not submit reply to Show Cause Notice."

AND WHEREAS the submission of the appeal has been delayed by seven months and 25 days beyond the prescribed time limit of 60 days. The appellant in his letter dt. 22.07.2016 submitted that during the period of two months, within which the appeal was to be filed, there was a dispute against the society and to settle the matter the appellant had to move the court and attend hearings resulting in mental strain. The Appellant during this period and till the dispute was settled was not in a position to appeal. In these circumstances, the appellant request consideration of his appeal. The Committee, noting the submissions of the appellant, decided to condone the delay and consider the appeal.

AND WHEREAS Sh. Arun Kumar Tiwari, Representative and Sh. Ashish Pandey, Representative, M.Ed. Vibhag, Ganpat Sahay Post Graduate College, Payagipur, Sadar, Sultanpur, Uttar Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 23/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that a reply to the show cause notice was submitted to the N.R.C. in their letter Ref. No. GSM/NCTE/D.El.Ed./04 dated 25 April 2015 and it was registered in the dairy of NRC at S.No. 100540 dated 27th April, 2015. The appellant also submitted that without any consideration of this reply NRC has passed an order to refuse their application for recognition.

AND WHEREAS in the course of presentation the appellant submitted a copy of their letter no. GSM/NCTE/D.El.Ed./04 dt. 25.04.2015 addressed to the NRC, which is a reply to the decision of the NRC taken in their 235th meeting held on 15-18 April, 2015, to issue the show cause notice to the institution. The formal show cause notice was issued on 29.04.2015. This copy of the letter bears NRC's receipt and date stamp i.e. 100540 dt. 27.04.2015. This letter, however is not found in the file of the NRC. In these circumstances, the Committee concluded that the matter deserved to be remanded to the N.R.C. with a direction to consider the reply of the appellant and take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant is directed to send a copy of their letter dt. 25.04.2015, with all its enclosures to the N.R.C. within 15 days of the receipt of the orders on the appeal.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to N.R.C. with a direction to consider the reply of the appellant and take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant is directed to send a copy of their letter dt. 25.04.2015, with all its enclosures to the N.R.C. within 15 days of the receipt of the orders on the appeal.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of M.Ed. Vibhag, Ganpat Sahay Post Graduate College, Payagipur, Sadar, Sultanpur, Uttar Pradesh to the NRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Manager/Secretary, M.Ed. Vibhag Ganpat Sahay Post Graduate College, Plot/Khasra No. 355, 354, 361, 352, Street No. 01, Village & PO-Payagipur, Tehsil/Taluka-Sadar, Sultanpur, State-Uttar Pradesh-228001.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Northern Regional Committee, Fourth Floor, Jeevan Nidhi-II, LIC Building, Bhawani Singh Marg, Ambedkar Circle, Jaipur - 302005, Rajasthan.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Uttar Pradesh, Lucknow.

(23)

F.No.89-349/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Pailan College of Education, Daulatpur, Bishnupur, South 24 Parganas, West Bengal dated 13/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER/7-215.8.31/ERCAPP4311/(D.El.Ed.)/2016/46867 dated 31/05/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the grounds that "a. Show cause notice was issued on 14/04/2016 on the following grounds: (i) As per record available, the name of the recognized institution for B.Ed. programme is Pailan College of Management & Technology (B.Ed. Section) whereas the institution applied D.El.Ed. programme in the name of Pailan College of Education. (ii) The institution comes under the category of standalone institution. As per NCTE Regulations 2014, standalone institution is not considered. (iii) Building plan approved by any Govt. Engineer not submitted. b. In response to show cause notice, the institution submitted its reply dated 12/04/2016 on the basis of proceeding uploaded in the ERC website which is not satisfactory. In view the above, the Committee decided as under: The Committee is of the opinion that application bearing code No. ERCAPP4311 of the institution regarding permission for D.El.Ed. Programme is refused under section 15(3)(b) of NCTE Act 1993."

AND WHEREAS Sh. M. M. Mahesh, Representative and Mahashewta Panda, Representative, Pailan College of Education, Daulatpur, Bishnupur, South 24 Parganas, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 23/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation and in a letter dated 16.06.2016 as it was submitted that "as already submitted in their reply to SCN to ERC, their institution's name is Pailan College of Education. However, in the Recognition order issued by ERC, they have mentioned as Pailan College of Management & Technology (B.Ed. Section). A copy of the E.R.C's order dt. 22.10.2009 granting recognition for B.Ed. course is enclosed. Time and again their institution had represented to ERC requesting to make changes in the name of

institution (two such letters dated 6th April 2010 & 18th May 2010 are attached). Even the land documents submitted to NCTE at the time of permission/recognition for B.Ed. course were in the name of Palain College of Education. The above documents were also shown to the Appellant Authority during their earlier appeal and the Appellate Authority vide order No. 89-910/2009/Appeal dated 8th Oct., 2009 also indicated the name of their college as Pailan College of Education. Even the affiliating body i.e. University of Calcutta had granted affiliation to their institution with the name as Pailan College of Education. The ERC also in its 210th meeting held on 7th-9th April, 2016 had accepted the request for change of name of their institution to Pailan College of Education. In view of the above submissions, the appellant would like to bring to the notice of the appellate authority that as on date their existing institution's name is Pailan College of Education and their application for D.El.Ed. Course comes under the category of composite institution. The building plan duly approved by the Government Engineer was submitted to ERC in response to SCN. The appellant with his letter dt. 16.06.2016 enclosed a copy of the order F.No. ERC/7-210.2.3/B.Ed./2016/46684 dated 2.05.2016 issued by the ERC accepting the change in the name of the institution from 'Pailan College of Management & Technology B.Ed. Section' to 'Pailan College of Education' from the date of issue of the order.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the explanation furnished by the appellant and the order issued by the E.R.C. accepting the change in the name of the institution establishes that the appellant comes under the category of a composite institution as envisaged in the NCTE Regulations, 2014. Regarding non-submission of the building plan approved by a Government Engineer, it is seen from the file of the E.R.C. that (i) the plan enclosed to the hard copy of the application was approved by the Pradhan of the Gram Panchayat and; (ii) no building plan approved by a Government Engineer was enclosed to the reply to the show cause notice as claimed by the appellant in his online appeal dt. 13.06.2016. The reply dt. 12.04.2016 did not contain any mention about the building plan. It is only in their letter dt. 16.06.2016 that the appellant stated that building plan approved by the Government Engineer has since been submitted to the E.R.C. The appellant, at the time of presentation, submitted copies of the building plan approved by the Sub-Asst. Engineer, Kakdwip Dev. Block, South 24 Parganas on 21.12.2015.

AND WHEREAS in view of the foregoing position, the Committee concluded that the matter deserved to be remanded to the ERC with a direction to process the application further as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant should send the copies of the building plan approved by a Government Engineer to the ERC within 15 days of receipt of the orders on the appeal.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to ERC with a direction to process the application further as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant should send the copies of the building plan approved by a Government Engineer to the ERC within 15 days of receipt of the orders on the appeal.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Pailan College of Education, Daulatpur, Bishnupur, South 24 Parganas, West Bengal to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Managing Trustee (Acting), Pailan College of Education, Bastu, 2A, 2B, 2C, 2D, 2E, Daulatpur, Bishnupur, South 24 Parganas, West Bengal – 700104.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

24

F.No.89-350/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Gyan Prakash College of Education, Chiraila, Gaya, Bihar dated 13/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER-212.6.50/ERCAPP3587/(D.El.Ed. (Addl. Course)/2016/46505 dated 02/05/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, granting recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. Additional course for one unit (intake of 50) instead of two units (intake of 100).

AND WHEREAS Sh. Rajesh Ranjan Sahay, Treasure, Gyan Prakash College of Education, Chiraila, Gaya, Bihar presented the case of the appellant institution on 23/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that their institution had submitted an application to ERC for two units of D.El.Ed. Course. When the visiting team visited their institution, they were shown the infrastructural and instructional facilities for two units D.El.Ed. Course and they were very much satisfied with the infrastructural and instructional facilities provided in their institution. While deciding grant of 7 (13) to their institution, the ERC had sought option from their institution for one / two units of D.El.Ed. Course and their institution in reply to 7 (13) had submitted the option for two units of D.El.Ed. Course and appointed staff for two units of D.El.Ed. Course as per NCTE Regulations 2014. In response to 7(13) decided by ERC, their institution had appointed additional staff for two units of D.El.Ed. Course (100) and had submitted the affidavits and approval of the affiliating body for the same. As on date, their institution is having staff strength for two units of D.El.Ed. Course (100), the details of which have already been submitted alongwith the reply to 7 (13) to ERC under NCTE Regulations, 2014. In spite of the fact that their institution had appointed total staff for two additional units of D.El.Ed. course, duly approved by the affiliating body, the ERC decided to grant recognition to their institution for one Unit of D.El.Ed. Course only. As on date their institution is having total built up area of

4762.88 sqm. and land area of 3078.48 sqm. as against requirement of 4000 sqm. of built up area and 3000 sqm. of land area. By denying the additional one unit, their institution will be placed under heavy financial burden, as they have provided all the infrastructure, instructional facilities and also appointed staff for two units of D.El.Ed. Course. Hence, the Appellate Authority is requested to kindly consider their request and direct ERC to grant recognition to their institution for two units of D.El.Ed. Course.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant in the affidavit enclosed to the hard copy of the online application affirmed that their application was for grant of recognition with an intake of 100 students. The Visiting Team that conducted an inspection noted that the intake is 100 and found the facilities adequate. As per the Letter of Intent (L.O.I) issued on 28.03.2016, the appellant was required to intimate their willingness in an affidavit about the number of units either one or two. The institution in the affidavit enclosed to their reply to the Letter of Intent (L.O.I.) dt. 18.04.2016 opted for two units (100 seats) in D.El.Ed. course. The appellant in reply to the L.O.I., inter-alia, furnished the list of faculty of one H.O.D., 13 lecturers and three teachers for fine arts, music and physical education approved by the Bihar School Education Board. Even after noting these informations furnished by the appellant, E.R.C. without assigning any reasons, decided to grant recognition for one unit (50 intake) only. In these circumstances, the Committee concluded that the matter deserved to be remanded to the E.R.C. with a direction to consider the request of the appellant for grant of recognition for two units (100 intake) of D.El.Ed. course as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. with a direction to consider the request of the appellant for grant of recognition for two units (100 intake) of D.El.Ed. course as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Gyan Prakash College of Education, Chiraila, Gaya, Bihar to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Treasurer, Gyan Prakash College of Education, Sale Deed, 977 (New), 978 (New), Chiraila, Gaya, Bihar – 805131.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Bihar, Patna.

(26)

F.No.89-352/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of College of Education, Panigaon, Nagaon, Assam dated 13/06/2016 is against the Order No. ERC/7-208.8.63/ERCAPP3226/M.Ed./2015/45330 dated 12/4/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting M.Ed. course on the grounds that "1. Show cause notice was issued on 10/02/2016 on the following grounds. (i) The submitted building plan is not a proper building plan. (ii) Total land area and total built up area is not indicated in the submitted building plan. 2. In response to Show Cause Notice, the institution submitted its reply dated 24/02/2016. The institution is still deficient on the following grounds: (i) The submitted building plan is not a proper building plan. (ii) Total land area and total built up area is not indicated in the submitted building plan. In view of the above, the Committee decided as under: The Committee is of the opinion that application bearing code No. ERCAPP3226 of the institution regarding permission for M.Ed. course is refused under section 15(3)(b) of NCTE Act 1993."

AND WHEREAS Dr. Manoshikha Baruah, Principal, College of Education, Panigaon, Nagaon, Assam presented the case of the appellant institution on 23/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation and in a letter dt. 20.07.2016, it was submitted that "they have already submitted the proper building plan as per NCTE requirement to ERC, Bhubaneswar on 14/03/2016. Building plan is prepared showing total land area and built up area as required by NCTE Regulation 2014. Additional land (1 Bigha, 4 Kathas, 10 Lossa) is purchased to meet the requirement of composite structure of the course B.Ed. and M.Ed."

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant, besides a letter dt. 24.02.2016, submitted another letter dt. 14.03.2016, which was received in the E.R.C. on 17.03.2016. With this letter the appellant has furnished copies of the

building plans showing the details of land area and built up area and approved by the Assistant Engineer, PWD (R), Nagaon State Road Division. The appellant, with his appeal also submitted some copies of the building plans containing the required details. In these circumstances, the Committee concluded that the matter deserved to be remanded to the E.R.C. with a direction to consider the details furnished by the appellant with his letter dt. 14.03.2016 and take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant is also directed to submit the copies of the building plans and other land documents enclosed to the appeal, to the E.R.C. within 15 days of receipt of the orders on appeal.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. with a direction to consider the details furnished by the appellant with his letter dt. 14.03.2016 and take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant is also directed to submit the copies of the building plans and other land documents enclosed to the appeal, to the E.R.C. within 15 days of receipt of the orders on appeal.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of College of Education, Panigaon, Nagaon, Assam to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Principal, College of Education, 1277, Panigaon, Nagaon, Assam – 782003.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Assam, Dispur.

27

F.No.89-353/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Mass Education Primary Teachers Training Institute, Patharpratima, South 24 Parganas, West Bengal dated 21/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER/7-EM-212.7.12/ERCAPP2949/B.Ed./2016/46612 dated 02/05/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the grounds that "(1) Show cause notice was decided in 211th ERC Meeting held on 14-16 April, 2016 on the following grounds that the Building plan and building completion certificate is not signed by any Govt. Engineer. (2) In response to show cause notice, the institution submitted its reply dated 19/04/2016 on the basis of proceedings uploaded in the ERC website, which is not acceptable. In view of the above, the Committee decided as under: The Committee is of the opinion that application bearing code no. ERCAPP2949 of the institution regarding permission for B.Ed. (Addl. Course) is refused under section 15(3)(b) of NCTE Act 1993."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Sukumar Singh, President, Mass Education Primary Teachers Training Institute, Patharpratima, South 24 Parganas, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 23/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation and in their letter dt. 22.06.2016 it was submitted that they are submitting a copy of fresh building plan and building completion certificate duly signed by Government Engineer. At the time of hearing the appellant submitted a copy of their letter dt. 02.05.2016 addressed to the E.R.C. and with which they sent copies of building plan and building certificate approved by Government Assistant Engineer.

AND WHEREAS the Committee, noting that the requisite documents were forwarded by the appellant after issue of the refusal order (based on the decision taken by the E.R.C. in their Emergent Meeting held on 14-16 April, 2016),

concluded that the E.R.C. was justified in refusing recognition and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the E.R.C. confirmed.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the memorandum of appeal, affidavit, the documents available on records and considering the oral arguments advanced during the hearing, the Committee concluded that the ERC was justified in refusing recognition and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of the ERC is confirmed.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby confirms the Order appealed against.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The President, Mass Education Primary Teachers Training Institute, 407, 410, 412, 413, 467, own land, Dakshin Shibgunge, Patharpratima, South 24 Parganas, West Bengal – 743371.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

28

F.No.89-354/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 6/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of North Bengal Teachers Training College, Dalkhola, Uttar Dinajpur, West Bengal dated 26/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER/7-216.7.58/ERCAPP3957/(D.El.Ed.)/2016/47397 dated 23/06/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the grounds that "(a). Show cause notice was issued on 02/06/2016 on the following grounds: (i) As per VT report, built up area is 2650.0 sq. mts. which is less than the requirement stipulated for B.Ed.+D.El.Ed. Programme. (ii) As per building plan, total built up area is 3320.0 sq. mts. which differs from VT report. (iii) Building completion certificate issued from Govt. Engineer not submitted. b. In response to show cause notice, the institution submitted its reply dated 27/04/2016 on the basis of proceedings uploaded in the ERC website which is not satisfactory. In view of the above, the committee decided that application bearing code No. ERCAPP3957 of the institution regarding permission for D.El.Ed. Programme is refused under section 15(3)(b) of NCTE Act 1993."

AND WHEREAS Md. Abul Kalam, Secretary, North Bengal Teachers Training College, Dalkhola, Uttar Dinajpur, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 23/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "It is stated that after online application was made and hard copy for the same was submitted to ERC, building plan was revised. It is stated that the construction of the building is actually in accordance with revised plan and is having completion certificate. In the said premise the completion certificate by Civil Engineer was issued after being satisfied that the Building has been constructed in accordance with the sanctioned building plan. Appellant states that actually total constructed area of appellant's college building at present is 3057 sq. mts. (approx) as per revised plan. The extended area of the constructed building is 426 sq. mts.

which was not reflected in previous plan that is perceived by VT team which measuring 2650 sq. mts. (accurate measurement 2631 sq. mts.) The extended area measuring 426 sq. mts. in which, Standing canteen measuring 98 sq. mts. Parking measuring 120 qs. Mts. Safety stair with electric room on the Gr. Floor, 1st Floor and 2nd Floor measuring in total 99 sq. mts. Balcony on Ground Floor and Management Room on 1st Floor which measuring 77 sq. mts. The rest common shade on 3rd Floor attached stair room measuring 32 sq. mts. respectively. It is stated that all these constructions are required to be added while calculating the built up area. It is stated that land area for the institute is 96.5 decimal which is equivalent to 3907 sq. mts. (approximately). In the show cause notice it was alleged that VT report says that the build up area is 2650.0 sq. mts. which is less than the requirement stipulated under B.Ed.+D.El.Ed. programme. In response to the same appellant replied on 27/04/2016 which was received by the office of Eastern Region, NCTE on 30/04/2016. In the said response appellant had mentioned the reason for difference. It is stated that at the time of filing online application form appellant had given one sanctioned plan which was thereafter revised in accordance with law. However, mistakenly when visiting team came to the site appellant had given copy of the earlier sanction plan instead of giving the present sanction plan, which makes it clear that the built-up area for the institute does not fall below the minimum prescribed area. It is stated that in the earlier plan there was a proposed one storied building annexed to the main building having built-up area around 700 sq. mts. but when construction work was undertaken it was suggested by Engineers to add certain area in the main building including canteen, parking area and other constructions. As with that construction work the total built up area was coming more than 3000 sq. mts. as required under NCTE Regulation 2014 the appellant decided not to construct the annex building and thus accordingly the plan was revised. However, mistakenly the same was not handed over to visiting team on 17/03/2016. Thus there is a difference in total built up area and the same is different from VT report. As the earlier plan was handed over to Visiting Team, they could not consider the other constructed portion. It is further stated that the appellant is already having building completion certificate as per new plan and the same was given along with the reply to show cause issued in April, 2016."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee after going through the relevant records observed that: -

(a) The institution in reply to a Show Cause Notice (S.C.N.) dated 02.06.2016 submitted its reply enclosing therewith (i) Copy of Building Completion Certificate (B.C.C.), (ii) C.L.U. and (iii) Building Plan.

(b) Instead of issuing a speaking order, E.R.C. while refusing recognition simply stated that reply dated 27.04.2016 is not satisfactory.

(c) E.R.C. failed to take note that the built up area mentioned in the B.C.C. include 2345 sq. feet of Asbestos roofing which is not allowed as per NCTE Regulations, Clause 8(7).

(d) Visiting Team while conducting inspection of the institution on 17/03/2016 observed and made certain negative observations which were not conveyed to appellant institution.

(e) So far as B.C.C. is concerned, Appeal Committee is of the view that B.C.C. signed by 'Assistant Engineer, Malda Sub Division, Social Sector, P.W. Dte' and countersigned by Gram Pradhan is a valid document.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee decided to remand back the case to E.R.C. for revisiting the case in light of observations made in para 3 above and issue revised order after following due procedure.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. for revisiting the matter and issue speaking order after following due procedure.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. for revisiting the matter and issue speaking order after following due procedure.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of North Bengal Teachers Training College, Dalkhola, Uttar Dinajpur, West Bengal to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, North Bengal Teachers Training College, 1304, B.Ed. College, 171, 172, 179, Bikour, Dalkhola, Uttar Dinajpur, West Bengal – 733215.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

29

F.No.89-355/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Shaheed Kanshi Ram College of Physical Education, Majra, Kharar, Mohali, Punjab dated 27/06/2016 is against the Order No. NRC/NCTE/NRCAPP-10704/252st (Part -8) Meeting 2016/153166-69 dated 11/07/2016 of the Northern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting M.P.Ed. course on the grounds that "Land documents submitted by the institution are neither in the name of the institution nor in the name of the society."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Harbans Singh, Trustee and Dr. Bhupinder Singh, Member, Shaheed Kanshi Ram College of Physical Education, Majra, Kharar, Mohali, Punjab presented the case of the appellant institution on 23/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "The land documents submitted alongwith the application are well in the name of SKR Educational Trust. It is to submit that the residents of village Bhagoo Majra, Tehsil Kharar, now District Mohali executed a gift deed in favour of National Education Society, Kharar of the land measuring 160 Khanals out of the land bearing Khasra no. 106(389-5) situated at village Bhagoo Majra vide gift deed dated 18/07/1973 duly registered in the office of Sub-Registrar Kharar. Thereafter, the National Education Society decided to create a trust in the name and style of "Shaheed Khansi Ram Educational Trust" and merged itself into the said trust and a trust deed was also executed by the members of the trust who were also members of the National Education Society on 14/05/1978 which was duly registered in the office of Sub-Registrar Kharar on 14/08/1978. As per the terms of the trust deed the National Education Society which was the creator of the trust has delivered to the trust all its property and assets and further it was undertaken by the National Education Society that it would have no connection with any of its assets in future. So all the properties including

the land given to the National Education Society through the Gift Deed dated 18/07/1973 deemed to have been vested in Shaheed Kanshi Ram Educational Trust and so Shaheed Kanshi Ram Trust is the absolute owner of the land mentioned in the Trust Deed."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that appellant institution is already recognised for conducting D.P.Ed. (since 2007) and B.P.Ed. (since March, 2015) courses on the same land and details of the courses has been entered at page 4 of the application form. As regards land of the institution, it is observed that 'National Education Society' possessed this land through a gift deed registered in the year 1973. Subsequently, the above society created a trust by name 'Shaheed Kanshi Ram Educational Trust, and the property and assets of the society were handed over to the management of Trust through a Trust Deed registered in 1978. In reply to a Show Cause Notice (S.C.N.) dated 25.02.2016, the appellant had furnished certified copy of the registered land documents to N.R.C on 07.04.2016.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that office of N.R.C., Jaipur did not raise any objection on the land documents before causing inspection and same land documents were accepted as valid documents for granting recognition for B.P.Ed. course in March, 2015. N.R.C. at the best could have asked the appellant institution to get a rectification deed registered so as to ensure that the present name of the Trust is entered on the land documents. Appeal committee, decided to remand back the case to N.R.C. Jaipur for revisiting the case as the land is possessed by the appellant Trust by virtue of the 'National Education Society' merged in the 'Shaheed Kanshi Ram Educational Trust.'

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to N.R.C., Jaipur for revisiting the matter as land is possessed by the appellant Trust by virtue of 'National Education Society' merged in the 'Shaheed Kanshi Ram Educational Trust'.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Shaheed Kanshi Ram College of Physical Education, Majra, Kharar, Mohali, Punjab to the NRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Chairman, Shaheed Kanshi Ram College of Physical Education, 106/1, SKR Educational Trust Regd., 370, Bhagoo Majra, Kharar, Mohali, Punjab - 140301.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Northern Regional Committee, Fourth Floor, Jeevan Nidhi-II, LIC Building, Bhawani Singh Marg, Ambedkar Circle, Jaipur - 302005, Rajasthan.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Punjab, Chandigarh.

30

F.No.89-157/2015 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Radha Krishna Sikaria Educational Institution, Radha Nagar, Motihari, Purba Champaran, Bihar dated 06/10/2015 is against the Order No. ERC/7-194.9.36/ERCAPP2368/ (B.Ed.-Addl. Intake)/2015/35564 dated 21/09/2015 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing permission for additional intake in B.Ed. course on the grounds that "(i) As per Apendix-4 Norms and Standards for Bachelor of Education Programme leading to the Bachelor of Education (B.Ed.) Degree Under Sub Clause 3(1) there shall be a basic unit of 50 students with a maximum of two units. Taking the above Clause of the Regulation 2014 into consideration, the Eastern Regional Committee observed as follows; the institution is already recognised for two basic units (100 intake) for B.Ed. course. As per the Regulation 2014 Norms and Standards the institution shall not be permitted beyond the two basic units (100 intake). Hence the Eastern Regional Committee decided as follow: Since the applicant institution has crossed the limit of two maximum basic units; hence no further additional intake is permitted. Deficiency letter issued dated 31/08/2015 is treated cancelled. Corrigendum be issued accordingly. Hence, the deficiency letter issued on 31/08/2015 is cancelled and a corrigendum has been issued vide letter No. 35557 dated 21/09/2015 to the institution."

AND WHEREAS Radha Krishna Sikaria Educational Institution, Radha Nagar, Motihari, Purba Champaran, Bihar was asked to present the case of the appellant institution on 16/12/2015 and 27/05/2016 and 23.07.2016 but nobody appeared. The Committee decided to conclude the appeal on the basis of available records.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that the impugned order dated 21.09.2015 is on the ground that application for grant of permission for B.Ed. (Additional intake) beyond two basic units of 50 is not permitted.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that Norms and Standards for B.Ed. course restrict the intake to a maximum of two units of 50 students (Para -3 Appendix 4). However, in para 6.1 of the norms it is stated that for an additional intake of 50 seats, the institution shall possess additional land of 500 sq. meters. For an annual intake beyond two hundred and upto three hundred, it shall possess land of 3500 sq. meters. Appeal Committee is of the opinion that restriction of intake to two units is for the initial intake and institutions which are already conducting B.Ed. course are eligible to apply for additional unit depending upon the availability of resources as mentioned in the Norms and Standards. Appeal Committee further noted that appellant has enclosed with its appeal memorandum copies of following orders issued by E.R.C. in which recognition is granted for B.Ed. course in excess of two units of 50 students:

(i) ERC/NCTE/BR-S/E-7/96/B.Ed. (Revised order) 2015/32555 dt. 30.05.2015.

(ii) ERC/NCTE/APE00506/B.Ed. (Revised Order)/32606 dt. 31/05/2015.

(iii) ERC/NCTE/BR-S/E-2/96 B.Ed. (Revised Order)/2015/32737 dt. 31.05.2015.

(iv) ERC/NCTE/APE 00219 & ERC APP 1074(B.Ed. (Revised Order)/2015 dt. 31.05.2015.

(v) ERC/NCTE/JH-5/N-3/2001/B.Ed.(Revised Order)/2015/32764 dt. 31.05.2015.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee further observed that E.R.C. had sought directions from NCTE vide its letter no. ERC/10-01/OA/2015/Pt. II/37452 dated 23.10.2015 for crossing the limit of two maximum basic units in B.Ed. course. It appears that NCTE (HQ) did not respond to the queries of the E.R.C.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee decided to remand back the case to E.R.C. for reconsidering the application of appellant institution keeping in view the infrastructural resources available with the appellant institution.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the memorandum of appeal, affidavit, documents available on records, the Committee concluded that the appeal deserves to be remanded to E.R.C. for reconsidering the application of appellant institution keeping in view the infrastructural resources available with the appellant institution.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Radha Krishna Sikaria Educational Institution, Radha Nagar, Motihari, Purba Champaran, Bihar to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Radha Krishna Sikaria Educational Institution 776,781, in the name of institution, Radha Nagar, Nackched Tola, Motihari, Purba Champaran, Bihar – 845401.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Bihar, Patna.

31

F.No.89-160/2015 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Sri Sai D.El.Ed. or Diploma in Education, Sangareddy, Medak, Andhra Pradesh dated 02/10/2015 is against the Order No. SRCAPP1384/D.El.Ed/AP/2013-14/50802 dated 19/04/2013 of the Southern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the grounds that "approved blue print of the building plan issued by competent civil Authority is not submitted. In the building plan copy submitted, total built up area shown as 1036.07 sq. mts, which is less than the requirement of 1500 sq.mts., as per NCTE norms. Built up area as shown in building plan is 1036.07 sq.mts. whereas in building completion certificate, the built up area shown as 1504.97 sq.mts, both are not tallying. The reply to the show cause notice is not satisfactory and unconvincing."

AND WHEREAS the appellant, aggrieved by the order of the S.R.C., which was decided in the S.R.C's 240th meeting held on 9-11 March, 2013, filed a Writ Petition No. 8158 of 2014 before the Hon'ble High Court of Judicature of Andhra Pradesh at Hyderabad. The Hon'ble High Court in their order dt. 19.03.2014, noting that "the order passed by the S.R.C. was an appealable order under Section 18 of the NCTE Act, 1993, dismissed the petition at the admission stage for not availing the appellate remedy available to the petitioner, which is an equally effective one, under Section 18 of the Act. Thereafter the appellant filed the appeal on 02.10.2015 i.e. nearly one year and seven and half months after the Hon'ble High Court passed their order. In the appeal the appellant submitted that they appealed to the NCTE on 16.07.2014 by registered post, but so far they did not receive any reply. It is also submitted that they personally approached NCTE, New Delhi on 23.09.2015 and as per advice they submitted the present online appeal."

AND WHEREAS Sri Sai D.El.Ed. or Diploma in Education, Sangareddy, Medak, Andhra Pradesh was asked to present the case of the appellant institution on 16/12/2015, 27.05.2016 and 23.07.2016 but nobody appeared.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee decided to condone the delay in preferring appeal on the basis of order dated 19.3.2014 of Hon'ble High Court of Andhra Pradesh in which the Court said that 'The controversy racked up in the Writ Petition is pure factual controversy that an effective alternative remedy should be availed so that judicial review exercise, if necessary can be carried out later.'

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that appellant society applied for recognition of a D.El.Ed. course in year 2011 and the impugned refusal order dated 19.04.2013 was on the ground that (i) Building Plan approved by Competent authority was not submitted and (ii) total built up area shown in the building plan is 1036 sq. meters whereas Building Completion Certificate is for 1504 sq. meters which is not tallying.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that appellant institution in reply to a Show Cause Notice (S.C.N) dated 16.05.2012 submitted copy of a building plan which shows the proposed plinth area of 1036 sq. meters plus a corridor area of 468 M^2 . The stamp and signatures of approving authority is very faint and not legible. Appellant alongwith its appeal memoranda submitted copy of building plan which is relatively more legible and it shows the plinth area as 1036 M^2 plus corridor area of 468 M^2 (Total 1504 M^2). The S.R.C., therefore, should have verified the assertions of the appellant institutions by getting a physical verification done.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee further noted that appellant institution is already recognised for HPT (Hindi Pandit) course since 2002. The recognition order dated 30.08.2002 issued by S.R.C. indicates that previous recognition was given at the address where society's office in located. So if both the courses are not located at one place it cannot be treated to be a composite institution and if both the institutions are proposed at one place, the appellant will have to show evidence of adequate built up space for the two courses.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to S.R.C. for getting the institutions inspected for verification of infrastructure available.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Sri Sai D.El.Ed. or Diploma in Education, Sangareddy, Medak, Andhra Pradesh to the SRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The President, Sri Sai D.El.Ed. or Diploma in Education, Plot No. 234, 4985/2004, Street No.1, Kulabgoor Village, Sangareddy Post and Taluk, Sangareddy City, Medak District – 502002, Andhra Pradesh.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Southern Regional Committee, Jnana Bharathi Campus Road, Nagarabhavi, Opp. National Law School, Bangalore - 560 072.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Andhra Pradesh, Hyderabad.

32

F.No.89-293/2015 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Bhoj University Campus, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh dated 11/12/2015 is against the Order No. WRC/APP2690/222/233rd/2015/154610 dated 27/10/2015 of the Western Regional Committee, rejecting their application for grant of recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the grounds that "The institute has submitted application for the D.El.Ed. Course. The institute is situated at Bhopal. As per the public notice issued by the NCTE for inviting applications for recognition of teacher training programmes, application for D.El.Ed. Course in Bhopal is not permitted. Thus, the application cannot be considered. Hence rejected. In view of the above, the application of the institution is hereby rejected."

AND WHEREAS Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Bhoj University Campus, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh was asked to present the case of the appellant institution on 16/03/2016, 27.05.2016 and 23.07.2016 but nobody appeared. The appellant in its appeal memorandum stated that "Applicant is a Government University and its area extends to all districts of Madhya Pradesh. There is shortage of trained teachers in Government schools."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that the Public Notice dated 27.02.2015 issued by NCTE was for inviting application for D.El.Ed. course for the academic session 2016-17 in respect of the State of Madhya Pradesh, from some selected districts. Bhopal was not included in the list of 20 districts from which applications were invited. Appeal Committee is also aware that the above restriction was challenged by some of the institutions located in the districts from which the applications were not invited and the Hon'ble High Court of Madhya Pradesh at Jabalpur in its order (W.P. NO. 19819/2015) had quashed the restrictions imposed in the Public Notice dated 27.02.2015. Appeal Committee further noted that NCTE has

filed a S.L.P. (No. 5102/2016) challenging the order of Hon'ble High Court of Madhya Pradesh and the Hon'ble Supreme Court vide an interim order dated 13.05.2016 has issued instructions that NCTE shall take independent decision at its level and communicate to the applicants. Final decision on the S.L.P. is still pending. Appeal Committee, therefore, decided to remand back the case to W.R.C. for taking a decision in this case in accordance with the final orders of Hon'ble Supreme Court as and when received.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit and documents on record, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to W.R.C., Bhopal to re-examine the issue in light of the orders of Hon'ble Supreme Court as and when received.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Bhoj University Campus, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh to the WRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Registrar, Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, No.2 Block No.4, Bhoj University Campus, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh - 462016.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Western Regional Committee, Manas Bhawan, Shayamala Hills, Bhopal - 462002.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Madhya Pradesh, Bhopal.

33

F.No.89-319/2015 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Rohitash College of Education, Mahendragarh, Haryana dated 18/12/2015 is against the Order No. NRC/NCTE/NRCAPP-5504/243rd Meeting/2015/126279 dated 17/10/2015 of the Northern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the grounds that "The institution has not submitted an affidavit that it would become composite institution before the commencement of session 2016-17. The institution has not submitted the NOC of the concerned affiliating body as required under clause 5(3) of NCTE Regulation 2014."

AND WHEREAS Cdr. R. S. Yadav, Chairman and Dr. Veena Yadav, Vice Chairperson, Rohitash College of Education, Mahendragarh, Haryana presented the case of the appellant institution on 27/05/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "The affidavit in regards to composite institution before commencement of session 2016-17 is enclosed. About NOC of affiliated University, it is submitted that institute application for the approval was for the year 2012. As directed by the Hon'ble High Court, New Delhi order No. WP(C) 4848/2015 dated 18/05/2015 NOC of affiliated University was not needed."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that appellant society/institution submitted application for B.Ed. course on 28.12.2012. The affiliating body for the course as mentioned in the application form is 'Maharishi Dayanand University, Rohtak.' The application submitted by the applicant was returned by N.R.C. to the applicant vide its letter dated 23.08.2013 on the basis of general recommendation of the State Government not to allow any teacher education programme in the State of Haryana. Subsequently, based on an order dated 18/05/2015 issued by Hon'ble High Court of Delhi, the appellant was able to resubmit its application for the

academic session 2015-16, which was processed by N.R.C. and a Show Cause Notice (S.C.N.) dated 25.08.2015 was also issued to the appellant institution.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that there are certain anomalies in the relevant file of N.R.C. The appellant's application dated 28.12.2012 is for B.Ed. course whereas the society's forwarding letter dated 27/05/2015 speaks of re-submission of application for a 4 year integrated B.Ed. college. The appellant however, did not submit a new application and the application fee of Rs. 1,50,000/- paid vide draft number 092346 dated 30.06.2015 drawn on Bank of Baroda is still found available in the relevant file. N.R.C. has not encashed the draft. The Show Cause Notice dated 25.08.2015 issued by N.R.C. is under NCTE Regulations, 2014 whereas appellant's application made under NCTE Regulations, 2014 for 4 year integrated course is not available on file and without having accepted the processing fee, N.R.C. should not have processed the so called new application.

AND WHEREAS another anomaly which came to the notice of Appeal Committee relates to the documents and Letters submitted by appellant to N.R.C. These documents pertain to the proposed D.El.Ed. course whereas the code no. NRCAPP5504 is the same as mentioned in the S.C.N. dated 25.08.2015 for B.Ed. course.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that refusal order dated 17.10.2015 is for B.Ed. course and it is on two grounds i.e. (i) composite nature of the institute and (ii) non-submission of N.O.C. from affiliating body.

AND WHEREAS appellant during the course of appeal presentation on 27/05/2016 furnished copy of an affidavit/undertaking that the institute would become composite institution before commencement of session 2016-17. Appellant also stated that the appellant is not under any obligation to submit N.O.C. as it submitted application in 2012 when N.O.C. was not required to be submitted by the applicant.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee after considering the arguments advanced by the appellant is of the opinion that before a final decision is taken, Committee shall get following points clarified by the appellant: -

(i) Application dated 28.12.2012 was for B.Ed. course with affiliating body as Maharishi Dayanand University, Rohtak.

(ii) Applicant while resubmitting application has mentioned the course name as '4 years Integrated B.Ed. programme'.

(iii) Applicant's letter dated 19/09/2015 mentions the course name as D.El.Ed. The affidavit, undertaking and application made to SCERT, Gurgaon for N.O.C. also mentions the course name as D.El.Ed. Appeal Committee decided that before appeal orders are made, appellant may be called upon to submit written clarification on the different nomenclatures of the course applied for.

AND WHEREAS Cdr. R.S. Yadav, Representative, Rohitash College of Education, Mahendragarh, Haryana appeared before the Appeal Committee on 23.07.2016 and made a written submission stating that course applied for is B.Ed. and reference to 4-year B.El.Ed. course was inadvertently made. The appellant further submitted that the appellant society had also one D.El.Ed. application pending for which they had submitted a reply dated 19/09/2015 and inadvertently mentioned the code number of B.Ed. application on that communication relating to D.El.Ed. Appellant submitted copy of another letter dated 19/09/2015 received and diarised in N.R.C. vide Diary NO. 111174 dated 21.09.2015 which is related to B.Ed. course.

AND WHEREAS the letter dated 19.09.2015 submitted by appellant institution to N.R.C is a reply to the Show Cause Notice (SCN) dated 25.08.2015. The SCN issued was on following grounds:

(i) Evidence of composite institution.

(ii) NOC from affiliating body.

(iii) Non submission of copy of registered land documents.

(iv) Non submission of Non Encumbrance Certificate.

(v) Non submission of C.L.U.

(vi) Affidavit in prescribed format.

AND WHEREAS perusal of relevant documents reveals that N.R.C. before deciding to refuse recognition for B.Ed. course had considered the documentary evidence submitted by appellant institution in respect of D.El.Ed. course. Some of the documents such as (i) copy of sale deed of land, (ii) Non Encumbrance Certificate and (iii) CLU are common to both the courses applied for, but there is no way that N.R.C. could have considered the affidavit and request for affiliation (N.O.C. request) made to SCERT, Haryana as a valid document for B.Ed. course.

Appeal Committee decided to convey its displeasure over the manner this file and documents are maintained in the office of N.R.C. The letter dated 19/09/2015 received in the office of N.R.C. on 21.09.2015 has not been added to the relevant file and instead decision was taken by N.R.C. on the basis of documents submitted for D.El.Ed. course.

Appeal Committee noted that appellant institution vide its letter dated 19/09/2015 for B.Ed. course (copy made available to Appeal Committee) has submitted affidavit attested on 21.09.2015. Further the appellant has submitted copies of its application made to affiliating body i.e. M.D. University for N.O.C. in respect of B.Ed. Integrated course. The affidavit and undertaking submitted are also for Integrated B.Ed. course. Copy of the resolution dated 2/12/2012 passed by applicant Trust i.e. Smt. Sarti Devi Educational Charitable Trust is also for opening of B.Ed. (Integrated Course). Appellant's submission dated 23.07.2016 that reference to 4 year B.El.Ed. course was inadvertently made is therefore, not tenable. Appeal Committee, therefore, decided to reject the appeal on the ground that:

(a) Appellant did not initiate any action for resumption of its application for B.Ed. course submitted in the year 2012 nor did it submit a new application for B.Ed. course under NCTE Regulations, 2014.

(b) The SCN dated 25.08.2015 was not properly replied to. Even, if the reply dated 19.09.2015 is taken on record, it contains affidavit, undertaking for Integrated B.Ed. course which was never applied for by the applicant institution.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to confirm the refusal order dated 17/10/2015.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby confirms the Order appealed against.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Chairman, Rohitash College of Education, 22, Gift Deed to Trust, Ateli Mandi, Mahendragarh, Haryana – 123021.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Northern Regional Committee, Fourth Floor, Jeevan Nidhi-II, LIC Building, Bhawani Singh Marg, Ambedkar Circle, Jaipur - 302005, Rajasthan.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Haryana, Chandigarh.

30

F.No.89-181/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Sarvoday College of Education (Girls), Meerut, Uttar Pradesh dated 05/03/2016 is against the decision taken by the N.R.C. at S. No. 227 of the minutes of their 250th meeting (Part -9) held on 28.02.2016 refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the grounds that "the reply of the applicant institution, with regard to S.C.N. sent on the basis of the decision of the N.R.C in its 249th meeting (Part-5) was considered. The reply is not acceptable to the N.R.C. as the building in which the proposed course is to be run has been acquired on rent basis (with an annual rent of Rs. 1000/-). This is in contravention of the Clause 8(4) (i) & (iii)of the NCTE Regulations 2014."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Sewa Ram Sharma, Secretary and Sh. Tribhash Singh, Representative, Sarvoday College of Education (Girls), Meerut, Uttar Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 28/05/2016 In the course of presentation, the appellant gave a letter dt. 28.05.2016. In this letter he submitted that they have not received till date the refusal order in pursuance of the decision taken by the N.R.C. in their 250th meeting held on 28.02.2016 and a request for a copy of the order has also been made under the provisions of the Right to Information (RTI) Act, 2005. In these circumstances, the appellant requested that until the refusal order becomes available, the hearing scheduled for 28.05.2016 may be kept pending.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the refusal order was issued by the N.R.C. on 02.05.2016. The Committee acceded to the request and decided to give the appellant another opportunity i.e. the second opportunity to present his case.

AND WHEREAS appellant appeared before the Appeal Committee on 23.07.2016 and submitted that the lease agreement dated 1.09.2014 was surrendered and surrender deed was also registered on 06.02.2015 i.e. before the date of online application. Appeal Committee noted that online application for D.El.Ed. course was made by applicant Trust 'Pt. Mahipal Singh Educational Welfare Trust' and the name of proposed institution is 'Sarvoday College of Education (Girls)'. As per land documents submitted alongwith application the land was registered in the name of 'Pt. Mahipal Sharma Educational Welfare Trust'. Change of Land Use Certificate (CLU) dated 25.10.2008 is also in the name of Pt. Mahipal Sharma Educational Welfare Trust. N.O.C. and building plan submitted by applicant institution were in the name of 'Sarvoday College of Education.'

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee further noted that applicant alongwith its application submitted copy of lease Deed dated 1/09/2014 under which the applicant Trust rented out the property to the 'Sarvoday College of Education' on a lease period of 29 years. As per NCTE, Regulations the land can either be owned by the society/trust or the institution at the time of application.

Appeal Committee further noted that N.R.C. decided to issue a Show Cause Notice (S.C.N.) to the applicant on the ground that 'the land of the institution is on private lease basis which is in violation of NCTE Regulations, 2014.' Appellant in reply to the above S.C.N. informed that ownership of land vests with the applicant Trust but in order to get affiliation from concerned affiliating body the land was required to be leased out to the institution as per byelaws of the affiliating body. The lease agreement was surrendered by applicant even before making online application.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee further noted that S.C.N. issued to the appellant was on the ground that land of the institution is on private lease whereas refusal is on the ground that building in which proposed course is to be run has been acquired on rent'. Committee found that reason for refusal is not found substantiated as the society/trust according to Regulation 8(4) (iii) is required to transfer and vest the title of the land and building in the name of institution within a period of six months from the date of issue of formal recognition. The above condition cannot be enforced as a pre-requisite.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee decided to remand back the case to N.R.C. for revisiting the case keeping in view the submission made by appellant in reply to S.C.N. and the surrender of Lease deed dated 06.02.2015. Appellant is required to submit a copy of surrender deed to N.R.C. within 15 days of the issue of Appeal orders.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to N.R.C. Jaipur for revisiting the case keeping in view the submission made by appellant that lease deed was surrendered even before the date of online application. Appellant is required to submit copy of the surrender deed dated 06/02/2015 to N.R.C. within 15 days of the issue of Appeal order.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Sarvoday College of Education (Girls), Meerut, Uttar Pradesh to the NRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary/Appellant, Sarvoday College of Education (Girls), 395, 396, Sale Deed, Rasna, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh – 250502.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Northern Regional Committee, Fourth Floor, Jeevan Nidhi-II, LIC Building, Bhawani Singh Marg, Ambedkar Circle, Jaipur - 302005, Rajasthan.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Uttar Pradesh, Lucknow.

(37)

F.No.89-187/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Delhi College of Management, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh dated 09/03/2016 is against the Order No. NRC/NCTE/NRCAPP-3531/246th Meeting/2015/132492 dated 30/12/2015 of the Northern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the ground that "the institution has not submitted reply of SCN dated 03/08/2015."

AND WHEREAS Delhi College of Management, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh was asked to present the case of the appellant institution on 28/05/2016 but nobody appeared. The Committee decided to give the appellant another opportunity i.e. the second opportunity to present their case.

AND WHEREAS Prof. Uma Shanker Goel, Chairman and Sh. Nitin Mittal, Secretary, Delhi College of Management, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 25.07.2016 i.e. the second opportunity given to them. In the appeal and during presentation and in a letter dt. 25.07.2016 it was submitted that they replied to the N.R.C. on 16.08.2015 stating that the building map was approved by Meerut Development Authority as a multi-storeyed building with Ground + 5 storeys; they have not yet completed the whole building; the competent authority will issue the Completion Certificate after completion of Ground + 5 storeys; and they will submit it after completion of the building. It is also submitted that they have to deposit again huge amount for further construction as departmental charges. At the time of presentation, the appellant submitted a copy of their reply to the N.R.C. dt. 16.08.2015 with the registered post receipt dt. 19.08.2015 copied thereon.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant's reply dt. 16.08.2015 is not available in the file of the N.R.C. In the circumstances, the

Committee concluded that the matter deserved to be remanded to the N.R.C. with a direction to consider the reply of the appellant, on its receipt, and take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant is directed to send a copy of his reply dated 16.08.2015 to the N.R.C. within 15 days of receipt of the orders on the appeal.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to N.R.C. with a direction to consider the reply of the appellant, on its receipt, and take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant is directed to send a copy of his reply dated 16.08.2015 to the N.R.C. within 15 days of receipt of the orders on the appeal.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Delhi College of Management, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh to the NRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Delhi College of Management, 990, Sale Deed, 990, Ghat, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh – 250005.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Northern Regional Committee, Fourth Floor, Jeevan Nidhi-II, LIC Building, Bhawani Singh Marg, Ambedkar Circle, Jaipur - 302005, Rajasthan.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Uttar Pradesh, Lucknow.

(41)

F.No.89-197/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of SBG Sanskrit Mission B.Ed. College, Tiruchirappalli, T.N. dated 15/03/2016 is against the Order No. SRO/NCTE/SRCAPP3588/B.Ed./TN/2016-17/80905 dated 30/01/2016 of the Southern Regional Committee, rejecting their application for grant of recognition for conducting B.Ed. course (Increase in intake) course on the grounds that "the reply to the SCN is not satisfactory. They have admitted the deficiency. We cannot wait indefinitely from them to produce the NOC. According to the Regulations it is the responsibility of the applicant to secure and attach the NOC from the affiliating body. That being so, it is decided to reject the application."

AND WHEREAS SBG Sanskrit Mission B.Ed. College, Tiruchirappalli, T.N. was asked to present the case of the appellant institution on 28/05/2016. The appellant submitted a letter dated 26.05.2016 stating that they could not attend the hearing on account of sudden death of a family member. The appellant requested ten days extension for attending. In these circumstances, the Committee decided to give the appellant another opportunity i.e. the second opportunity to present their case.

AND WHEREAS Sh. SV Murugappan, Representative and R. Senthama Rai, Representative, SBG Sanskrit Mission B.Ed. College, Tiruchirappalli, T.N., presented the case of the appellant institution on 25.07.2016 i.e. the third and final opportunity given to them. In the appeal and personal presentation, it was submitted that while as per NCTE norms at the time of application, the applicant should have NOC from the affiliating body, they filed the online application on 25.06.2015 and hard copy of the application on 26.06.32015 but they applied to TNTEU (Tamil Nadu Teachers Education University) on 22.07.2015 for the NOC. The appellant also submitted that they got Hon'ble High Court order to process their file and they will submit the NOC after receiving it from TNTEU, Chennai. The

appellant enclosed a copy of the order of the Hon'ble High Court of Judicature at Madras dt. 22.07.2015 in Writ Petition No. 22025 of 2015 filed by them.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the Council issued instructions to their Regional Committees informing them that for 2016-17, 15th July, 2015 will be the last date for submission of hard copies of the applications with NOC, irrespective of the date of online applications. The Committee also noted from the order of the Hon'ble High Court of Judicature at Madras dt. 22.07.2015 that the Hon'ble High Court directed the first respondent in the Writ Petition, namely, the Registrar, Tamil Nadu Teachers Education University, Chennai to consider and dispose of the petitioners application/representation dt. 30.06.2015, in accordance with law, on or before 27.07.2015, and communicate the decision taken, to the petitioner.

AND WHEREAS since the appellant has not submitted the NOC by the extended date of 15.07.2015, the Committee concluded that the SRC was justified in rejecting the application and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of SRC confirmed.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the memorandum of appeal, affidavit, the documents available on records and considering the oral arguments advanced during the hearing, the Committee concluded that the SRC was justified in refusing recognition and therefore, the appeal deserved to be rejected and the order of SRC is confirmed.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby confirms the Order appealed against.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary/Correspondent, SBG Sanskrit Mission B.Ed. College, 96/9A, Khasra, 96/9, 96/9A, Perugamani, Tiruchirappalli, Tamil Nadu – 639115.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Southern Regional Committee, Jnana Bharathi Campus Road, Nagarabhavi, Opp. National Law School, Bangalore - 560 072.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Tamil Nadu, Chennai.

L14

F.No.89-207/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Nalanda Science & Commerce College, Jhinjhari Katni, Katni, Madhya Pradesh dated 22/03/2016 is against the Order No. WRC/APP2554/222/241st/(M.P.)/2016/161367 dated 24/02/2016 of the Western Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the grounds that "Show Cause Notice dt. 14/01/2016 was issued to the applicant for submission of documents as required under NCTE Regulations, 2014. The applicant has again submitted only Xerox copies of the documents – the land ownership document is not originally certified and the other documents also are not originally notarized. Further, the applicant has not submitted a Building Completion Certificate which is required under the Regulations. It is therefore not possible to verify the claim of the applicant that sufficient built up area is available for two units of B.Ed. and the proposed D.El.Ed. From the Building Plan and Building Permission, it is not possible to decide how much built-up area is available. Since, the applicant has not complied with the requirement of the NCTE Regulations, 2014, recognition is refused.".

AND WHEREAS Sh. Ram Sujan Tiwari, Accountant, Nalanda Science & Commerce College, Jhinjhari Katni, Katni, Madhya Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 30/05/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "(i) the institution has sent originally notarised copies of C.L.U., building plan, building completion certificate and non-encumbrance certificate on 24.02.2016 by speed post i.e. within 30 days time limit; (ii) they have submitted original F.D.Rs and N.O.C. by speed post on 29.10.2015; (iii) against the requirement of 3500 sq. mts. of land for B.Ed. B.El.Ed. and D.El.Ed. as per norms, the institution has 4137.344 sq. mts. as per MAP No. 187/B and land registry; (iv) original certified copy of land document and original building completion certificate were sent to W.R.C. by speed post on 09.02.2016; (v) the

institution has 42 rooms of 20'x23' size (19320 sqt.), four halls of 20'x46' size(3680 sq.ft.) and a conference hall of 20'x115' (2300 sq. ft.), which is sufficient for B.Ed. & D.Ed. courses; and (vi) the W.R.C. could have verified the position from the documents submitted. In the course of presentation, the appellant submitted copies of Building Completion Certificate issued by Nagar Palika Nigam, Katni on 8.03.2016, certifying that the total built up area is 44,534 sq.ft."

AND WHEREAS the appellant in the course of presentation submitted a letter dt. 30.05.2016 stating that he will present Non-encumbrance certificate and copies of the F.D.R within 30 days. The Committee, therefore, decided to give the appellant another opportunity, i.e. the second opportunity to present their case.

AND WHEREAS Sh. Ram Sujan Tiwari, Accountant and Sh. Kedar Bichpuriya, Manager, Nalanda Science & Commerce College, Jhinjhari Katni, Katni, Madhya Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 25.07.2016 i.e. the second opportunity given to them. The appellant with their letter dt. 02.06.2016 forwarded notarised copies of the Non-encumbrance certificate, certificate of land and FDRs for Rs. 8 lakhs and Rs. 4 lakhs jointly held with the Regional Director, WRC.

AND WHEREAS the Committee, noting the claim of the appellant that they have submitted the requisite documents to the W.R.C. and the now submitted notarised copies of the documents promised in the hearing held on 30.05.2016 concluded that the matter deserved to be remanded to the W.R.C. with a direction to consider the documents already submitted by the appellant together with those enclosed to the appeal, a copy of which with its enclosures was forwarded to them with the Council's Office Memorandum No. F. 89-207/2016/Appeal/27883 dt. 05.05.2016 and take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant is directed to forward the documents sent with his letter dt. 02.06.2016 to the W.R.C. within 15 days of receipt of the orders on the appeal.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal

Committee concluded to remand back the case to W.R.C. with a direction to consider the documents already submitted by the appellant together with those enclosed to the appeal, a copy of which with its enclosures was forwarded to them with the Council's Office Memorandum No. F. 89-207/2016/Appeal/27883 dt. 05.05.2016 and take further action as per the NCTE Regulations, 2014. The appellant is directed to forward the documents sent with his letter dt. 02.06.2016 to the W.R.C. within 15 days of receipt of the orders on the appeal.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Nalanda Science & Commerce College, Jhinjhari Katni, Katni, Madhya Pradesh to the WRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The President, Nalanda Science & Commerce College, 29/46, PHN-1228/28, 29, Maharana Pratap Jhinjhari Katni, Madhya Pradesh – 483501.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Western Regional Committee, Manas Bhawan, Shayamala Hills, Bhopal - 462002.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Madhya Pradesh, Bhopal.

45

F.No.89-235/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Victoria College of Education, Gram - Morod, Indore, Madhya Pradesh dated 20/04/2016 is against the Order No. WRC/APP3552(MINORITY)/223/243rd/2016/161138 dated 23/02/2016 of the Western Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the grounds that "The applicant has applied online on 13/07/2015 which is after the last date i.e. 30/06/2015 for online applications. Hence, the application is summarily rejected. FDRs be returned, if submitted."

AND WHEREAS the appellant institution in its appeal memoranda submitted that "the applicant has applied on 30/06/2015 the payment was debited from the account and a receipt was generated but due to some technical problem code no. was not generated. The applicant has sent a mail to NCTE, Delhi on 01/07/2015 regarding the code generation and in reply NCTE, Delhi vide its mail dated 13/07/2015 generated the application code no. and sent a mail to the applicant and WRC Bhopal to accept the application. The applicant has also submitted the hard copy on 14/07/2015 within the time line."

AND WHEREAS appellant failed to make appearance before the Appeal Committee on 31.05.2016. As per extant appeal rules, three opportunities can be provided to an appellant to make personal appearance before the Appeal Committee. Appeal Committee, therefore, decided to give another opportunity (second) to the appellant to make submission before the Committee.

AND WHEREAS Sh. Vijendra Mishra, Assistant Professor and Sh. Apoorv Dixit, A/c Coordinator, Victoria College of Education, Gram - Morod, Indore, Madhya Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 25.07.2016 i.e. the

second opportunity granted to them. The appellant reiterated the submissions made in the appeal.

AND WHEREAS the Committee noted that the appellant, with his appeal, enclosed copy of the e-mail dt. 13.07.2015 sent by NCTE Headquarters informing the appellant that the I.D. of the application has been generated and advising that the mail may be attached to the necessary document and sent to the concerned Regional Committee. The Committee, noting that the I.D. number of the application got generated only after 30.06.2015 i.e. on 13.07.2015, with the intervention of NCTE Headquarters, concluded that the appeal deserved to be accepted and the matter remanded to the W.R.C. with a direction to process the application further as per NCTE Regulations, 2014.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to W.R.C. with a direction to process the application further as per NCTE Regulations, 2014.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Victoria College of Education, Gram - Morod, Indore, Madhya Pradesh to the WRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Victoria College of Education, 255/1/1/1, Sahib Shiksha Avam Samaj Kalya, 255/1/1/1, Gram Morod, Indore, Madhya Pradesh – 452021.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Western Regional Committee, Manas Bhawan, Shayamala Hills, Bhopal - 462002.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Madhya Pradesh, Bhopal.

46

F.No.89-186/2015 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Kamal Kailash Teachers Training Institute, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh dated 26/10/2015 is against the Order No. NRC/NCTE/NRCAPP-8885/243rd Meeting/2015/125116-19 dated 08/10/2015 of the Northern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the grounds that "the institution has not submitted compliance/documents as required in letter of intent issued under clause 7(13) of NCTE Regulation 2014 and Show Cause Notice issued in this regard."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Krishna Kumar Pandey, Member and Sh. Jitendra Pratap Singh, Manager, Kamal Kailash Teachers Training Institute, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 17/12/2015. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "the institution received the letter of intent dated 6th June, 2015. The institution applied for sending the panel for selection of faculty to the Registrar Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Avadh University, Faizabad (herein after referred as University for short) just after receiving the letter of intent. The University constituted panel and the names of experts were sent to the institution vide letter dated 28/08/2015 after about 2 months after expiry of the time mentioned in the letter of intent. The institution persistently requested the experts to fix the date for selection of faculty, and the date of selection was fixed as on 06/09/2015, 15/09/2015 and 17/09/2015 and the selections were made by the experts. The institution immediately sent the documents for approval to the University on 21/09/2015. The institution made frantic endeavour and the University granted approval on 30/09/2015. The institution sent information to the NRC on 06/10/2015 in compliance of the letter of intent by hand in order to avoid further loss of time. The show cause notice was issued to the institution in the terms of 241st meeting of NRC, but it was not received by the institution till date. The application of the institution was rejected in the 243rd

meeting of the NRC, which was held on 28-30, September, 2015. It is specific feature of the entire episode that there was fixed time for sending the reply to the letter of intent on the one hand and there is no fixed time for sending the experts for making selection of the faculty and granting approval though the entire formalities were completed by the institution and no short coming was ever informed to the institution by the University. There is no law to regulate the proceedings of the NRC and the University or other affiliating bodies as the case may be. In the absence of stipulation of time for granting approval to the selection made by the panel constituted by the University itself. NRC cannot control the University. Since, the activities of the University is not under the control of the institution, therefore, if there is any dearth due to lethargic move of the University, the institution should not be penalized. The institution applied for establishing B.Ed. College in the year 2012 for running 1 year B.Ed. course and there is no application of the Regulation framed in the year 2014. It is worth indicating that the institution has already received the recognition of D.El.Ed. 2 years course. The institution has already applied for running B.Ed. course and after recognition it will be composite institution. The NRC has committed manifest illegality in not considering that the institution has applied for recognition in 2012 when the Regulation of 2014 has not seen the light of the day."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that Letter of Intent (L.O.I.) was issued to appellant institution on 06.06.2015 and the failure of the institution to comply with the terms and conditions of L.O.I. resulted in issue of a Show Cause Notice (S.C.N.) on 18.08.2015. The appellant during the course of appeal presentation had categorically denied having received any S.C.N. and informed that compliance of L.O.I. was submitted to N.R.C. on 06.10.2015. Committee asked the appellant to furnish documentary evidence in the form of 'Postal Certificate' issued by concerned Post Master verifying non delivery of any communication addressed to the appellant by N.R.C. between the relevant dates. The appellant sought another opportunity to submit necessary evidence in support of its claim of not receiving the S.C.N. Committee decided to grant another opportunity.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that notice dated 04.07.2016 for hearing on 25.07.2016 was issued to appellant institution for attending the appeal

hearing on 25.07.2016. However, neither appellant appeared nor any communication was received submitting required documents. Appeal Committee noted that impugned refusal order dated 08.10.2015 issued by N.R.C. was on the ground that the appellant institution has not submitted compliance documents as required in the L.O.I. and Show Cause Notice (S.C.N). Appellant has admitted to the receipt of L.O.I. and denied having received the Show Cause Notice (S.C.N). Appeal Committee further noted that undelivered copy of S.C.N. is not found placed in the relevant file. Moreover, the decision to issue S.C.N. is also placed on the Website of NCTE and institutions applying for teacher education courses are expected to check the official website of NCTE to know the developments in processing of their applications. The conditions laid down in the L.O.I. were required to be complied within two months from 06.06.2015 and as such it was the duty of the appellant institution to have either complied with the requirements of L.O.I. or obtained some extra time for submitting compliance rather than waiting for a communication from NCTE. As L.O.I. was not replied to by the Appellant institution, Appeal Committee, decided to confirm the refusal order dated 09.10.2015.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavits, documents a record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to confirm the refusal order dated 09/10/2015 issued by N.R.C., Jaipur.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby confirms the Order appealed against.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Manager, Kamal Kailash Teachers Training Institute, 729, 730, 0, Akma, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh–224229.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Northern Regional Committee, Fourth Floor, Jeevan Nidhi-II, LIC Building, Bhawani Singh Marg, Ambedkar Circle, Jaipur - 302005, Rajasthan.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Uttar Pradesh, Lucknow.

47

F.No.89-358/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Mahaveer College of Education, Meerut, Sardhana Road, Uttar Pradesh dated 25/06/2016 is against the Order No. NRC/NCTE/NRCAPP-6892/235th Meeting/2015/101595 dated 21/05/2015 of the Northern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the grounds that "The institution did not reply to the Show Cause Notice."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Shailendra Yadav, Member and Sh. Satish Raghav, Manager, Mahaveer College of Education, Meerut, Sardhana Road, Uttar Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 25/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "We have received show cause notice dated 19/09/2013 and submitted a reply in person on 12/10/2013 vide diary no 160038 removing all deficiencies as were raised in the show cause notice. Therefore, it is not true that the reply to show cause notice was not submitted."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that there is a delay of about 11 months in filling appeal by the appellant. Appellant informed that before filing appeal a Writ Petition was filed by him in the Hon'ble High Court of Judicature at Allahabad and the Hon'ble Court had directed vide its order dated 30.05.2016 to file appeal under Section 18 of the NCTE, Act. Appeal Committee, therefore, decided to condone the delay and take up the appeal on the merits of the case.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that the impugned order dated 21.05.2015 was on the ground that appellant institution did not submit reply to Show Cause Notice (S.C.N.) dated 19.09.2013. Appellant during the course of appeal presentation on 25.07.2016 submitted valid evidence of having submitted reply to S.C.N. which was received in the office of N.R.C. Jaipur vide diary No. 160038 dated 12.10.2013. Communication dated 12.10.2013 (Diary No. 160038) is not

found placed on the relevant file. Appellant is, therefore, required to resubmit copy of its letter (with enclosure) dated 12.10.2013 to the office of N.R.C., Jaipur within 15 days of the receipt of Appeal orders. N.R.C. is required to process the reply to be submitted by appellant expeditiously and take further action accordingly.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to N.R.C. for processing the reply dated 12.10.2013 submitted by appellant vide diary no. 160038. Appellant is required to submit copy of its reply to S.C.N. dated 12.10.2013 to N.R.C. Jaipur within 15 days of the receipt of Appeal orders.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Mahaveer College of Education, Meerut, Sardhana Road, Uttar Pradesh to the NRC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Mahaveer College of Education, Vill.-Pohalli, Post-Dabathwa, Sardhana Road, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh - 250341.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Northern Regional Committee, Fourth Floor, Jeevan Nidhi-II, LIC Building, Bhawani Singh Marg, Ambedkar Circle, Jaipur - 302005, Rajasthan.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Uttar Pradesh, Lucknow.

(48)

F.No.89-359/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT and B.Ed. College, Midnapore, West Bengal dated 21/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER/7-EM-212.7.37/ERCAPP3546/(D.El.Ed.)/2016/46607 dated 21/05/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the grounds that "(1) Show cause notice was decided in 211th ERC Meeting held on 14-16 April, 2016 on the following grounds: (i) Land is in the name of "Pandit Iswar Chandra Primary Teachers Training Institute" whereas as per online application name of institution is "Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College" i.e. land is in the name of different institution. (ii) Building plan and building completion certificate is not approved by any Govt. Engineer. (iii) Change of land use certificate, land possession/mutation certificate issued from Land Revenue Department not submitted. The reply dated 21/04/2016 submitted on the basis of proceedings uploaded in the ERC website is not acceptable."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Rafik Ali Khan, Secretary and Sh. S.K. Najir Ali, Member, Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT and B.Ed. College, Midnapore, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 25/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "The applicant society "Marichya Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar Welfare Society" submitted its online application in the name of "Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College" for grant of recognition for the academic session 2016-17 with annual intake (50) for D.El.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3546) and B.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3550) on 24/06/2015 as a composite institute. The applicant society, despatched both the hard copy printout of the online application (D.El.Ed. and B.Ed.) along with all relevant documents and application fee. The application for D.El.Ed. (ERCAPP3546) and B.Ed. (ERCAPP3550) was complete in all respect as per NCTE Regulation 2014, where as in all the affidavits and undertakings it was

clearly mentioned that the proposed D.El.Ed. and B.Ed. application was under the Society "Marichya Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar Welfare Society. The applicant society, has satisfied all the norms for D.El.Ed. and B.Ed. application as laid down by NCTE Regulation 2014 and before submitting its online application was in possession of 19958.88 sq. mts. of Land and 3148 sq. mts. of Build-Up Area which satisfied all the norms for composite institution as per NCTE Regulation 2014. The applicant society obtained NOC from W.B.B.P.E. and the Vidyasagar University, Midnapore in the name of the institution and all other relevant documents including building plan is in favour of the institution/society. The ERC, NCTE after scrutiny of the documents submitted by the institution/society, satisfied and after passing more than 7 months issued VT inspection letter under section 14 of NCTE Act for D.El.Ed. course vide code No. ERCAPP3546/41004 dated 05/02/2016 and for B.Ed. course vide code No. ERCAPP3550/41007 dated 05/02/2016, which was inspected properly after one month i.e. on 08/03/2016 from the letter date. The applicant society had submitted its online application for D.El.Ed. (ERCAPP3546) programme and B.Ed. (ERCAPP3550) in the name of the institution "Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College" and all others documents in the name of the Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College" where Pt. denoted as "Pandit". The applicant society also submitted its affidavit and undertaking that Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar Primary Teachers Training Institute and Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College are same in all respects under the Society "Marichya Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar Welfare Society" and the confusion comes to make a composite institute. Which was absolutely an unintended typographical error/mistake or technical inaccuracies that was not considered. However, the managing body "Marichya Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar Welfare Society" is in possession of all functional aspects to establish the institution as a parent body, since in the initial stage, when there was no existence of the institution. The applicant society, in its reply dated 21/04/2016 against show cause notice vide proceedings of 211 meeting on 14-15 April 2016 by ERC, NCTE Bhubaneswar, submitted in its written submission alongwith all relevant documents and an explanation in confusion of names, to avoid the dispute as per show cause notice by ERC, NCTE and also prayed for consideration the applications. The applicant society, in good intention and willingness to become a composite institute filed the online application for D.El.Ed. Programme

(ERCAPP3546) and B.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3550) in compliance with the NCTE Regulation 2014, but dispute in names of the College was completely unintended. ERC, NCTE without consideration of the facts and documentations including affidavit/undertaken rejected the application of D.El.Ed. Programme (ERCAPP3546) vide order No. ER/7-EM-212.7.37/ERCAPP3546/(D.El.Ed.)/2016/46607 dated 02/05/2016 and B.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3550) vide order No. ER/7-EM-212.7.38/ERCAPP3350/(B.Ed.)/2016/46615, dated 02/05/2016 applied for the academic session 2016-17 with liberty to file an appeal to the applicant institution as per NCTE Act 1993. ERC NCTE, after passing of 10 months (approx.) from the receipt of the hard copies of the online application (02/07/2015) to issuance of rejection order (02/05/2016) refused application for D.El.Ed. Programme (ERCAPP3546) and B.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3550)."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that application for conducting D.El.Ed. course was made by applicant society i.e. 'Marichya Pt. Iswarchadra Vidyasagar Welfare Society'with institution name as 'Pt. Iswarchandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College.' The institution is proposed to be located at Plot/Khara number 1482/1490, Village – Marichya, City – Ghatal, Midnapore, West Bengal.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee, further noted that E.R.C. Bhubaneswar decided to issue a Show Cause Notice (S.C.N.) to appellant institution on the following grounds: -

(i) Land is in the name of 'Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar Primary Teacher Trg. Institution' whereas in the online application name of institution is 'Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College.'

(ii) Building Plan and Building Completion Certificate is not approved by Government Engineer.

(iii) C.L.U. issued by Land Revenue Department not issued.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee further noted that appellant in its reply dated 21.04.2016 informed E.R.C. that 'Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar Primary Teacher Training Institution' and 'Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College' are one and the same institution differentiated by the name of course only.

The appellant also submitted copies of building plan and building completion certificate duly signed by Government Sub. Assistant Engineer of Ghatal Block and approved by Gram Pardhan who is the competent authority. Change of Land Use Certificate (CLU) issued by Block Land & Reforms Officer, Government of West Bengal is also found enclosed with the reply to S.C.N. Appeal Committee also noticed that the appellant institution was got inspected by E.R.C. and the V.T. report dated 08.03.2016 is quite favourable for grant of recognition. In case E.R.C. had any doubt or suspicion pertaining to land documents, it should have been got clarified before inspection.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee after going through the relevant land documents does not consider that land documents should be modified to include the name of particular course so long as courses pertain to teacher education courses managed by the same society/Trust on same piece/s of land.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee decided to remand back the case to E.R.C. for further processing of the application.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. for further processing of the application.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT and B.Ed. College, Midnapore, West Bengal to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT and B.Ed. College, Plot No. 1482/1490, Village-Marichya, PO-Dondipur, Tehsil/Taluka – Ghatal, Midnapore, West Bengal -721222.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

(49)

F.No.89-360/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT and B.Ed. College, Midnapore, West Bengal dated 21.06.2016 is against the Order No. ER/7-EM-212.7.37/ERCAPP3546/(D.El.Ed.)/2016/46607 dated 21/05/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the grounds that (i) Land is in the name of "Pandit Iswar Chandra Primary Teachers Training Institute" whereas as per online application name of institution is "Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College" i.e. land is in the name of different institution. (ii) Building plan and building completion certificate is not approved by any Govt. Engineer. (iii) Change of land use certificate, land possession/mutation certificate issued from Land Revenue Department not submitted. The reply dated 21/04/2016 submitted on the basis of proceedings uploaded in the ERC website is not acceptable."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Rafik Ali Khan, Secretary and Sh. S.K. Najir Ali, Member, Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT and B.Ed. College, Midnapore, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 25/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "The applicant society "Marichya Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar Welfare Society" submitted its online application in the name of "Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College" for grant of recognition for the academic session 2016-17 with annual intake (50) for D.El.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3546) and B.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3550) on 24/06/2015 as a composite institute. The applicant society, despatched both the hard copy printout of the online application (D.El.Ed. and B.Ed.) along with all relevant documents and an application fee. The application for D.El.Ed. (ERCAPP3546) and B.Ed. (ERCAPP3550) was complete in all respect as per NCTE Regulation 2014, where as in all the affidavits and undertakings it was clearly mentioned that the proposed D.El.Ed. and B.Ed. application was under the

Society "Marichya Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar Welfare Society. The applicant society, has satisfied all the norms for D.El.Ed. and B.Ed. application as laid down by NCTE Regulation 2014 and before submitting its online application was in possession of 19958.88 sq. mts. of Land and 3148 sq. mts. of Build-Up Area which satisfied all the norms for composite institution as per NCTE Regulation 2014. The applicant society obtained NOC from W.B.B.P.E. and the Vidyasagar University, Midnapore in the name of the institution and all other relevant documents including building plan is in favour of the institution/society. The ERC, NCTE after scrutiny of the documents submitted by the institution/society, satisfied and after passing more than 7 months issued VT inspection letter under section 14 of NCTE Act for D.El.Ed. course vide code No. ERCAPP3546/41004 dated 05/02/2016 and for B.Ed. course vide code No. ERCAPP3550/41007 dated 05/02/2016, which was inspected properly after one month i.e. on 08/03/2016 from the letter date. The applicant society had submitted its online application for D.El.Ed. (ERCAPP3546) programme and B.Ed. (ERCAPP3550) in the name of the institution "Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College" and all others documents in the name of the Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College" where Pt. denoted as "Pandit". The applicant society also submitted its affidavit and undertaking that Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar Primary Teachers Training Institute and Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College are same in all respects under the Society "Marichya Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar Welfare Society" and the confusion comes to make a composite institute. Which was absolutely an unintended typographical error/mistake or technical inaccuracies that was not considered. However, the managing body "Marichya Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar Welfare Society" is in possession of all functional aspects to establish the institution as a parent body, since in the initial stage, when there was no existence of the institution. The applicant society, in its reply dated 21/04/2016 against show cause notice vide proceedings of 211 meeting on 14-15 April 2016 by ERC, NCTE Bhubaneswar, submitted in its written submission alongwith all relevant documents and an explanation in confusion of names, to avoid the dispute as per show cause notice by ERC, NCTE and also prayed for consideration the applications. The applicant society, in good intention and willingness to become a composite institute filed the online application for D.El.Ed. Programme (ERCAPP3546) and B.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3550) in compliance with the

NCTE Regulation 2014, but dispute in names of the College was completely unintended. ERC, NCTE without consideration of the facts and documentations including affidavit/undertaken rejected the application of D.El.Ed. Programme (ERCAPP3546) vide order No. ER/7-EM-212.7.37/ERCAPP3546/(D.El.Ed.)/2016/46607 dated 02/05/2016 and B.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3550) vide order No. ER/7-EM-212.7.38/ERCAPP3350/(B.Ed.)/2016/46615, dated 02/05/2016 applied for the academic session 2016-17 with liberty to file an appeal to the applicant institution as per NCTE Act 1993. ERC NCTE, after passing of 10 months (approx.) from the receipt of the hard copies of the online application (02/07/2015) to issuance of rejection order (02/05/2016) refused application for D.El.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3546) and B.Ed. programme (ERCAPP3550)."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that applicable for conducting D.El.Ed. course was made by applicant society i.e. 'Marichya Pt. Iswarchadra Vidyasagar Welfare Society'with institution name as 'Pt. Iswarchandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College.' The institution is proposed to be located at Plot/Khara number 1482/1490, Village – Marichya, City – Ghatal, Midnapore, West Bengal.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that E.R.C. Bhubaneswar decided to issue a Show Cause Notice (S.C.N.) to appellant institution on the following grounds:-

(i) Land is in the name of 'Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar Primary Teacher Trg. Institution' whereas in the online application name of institution is 'Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College.'

(ii) Building Plan and Building Completion Certificate is not approved by Government Engineer.

(iii) C.L.U. issued by Land Revenue Department not issued.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee further noted that appellant in its reply dated 21.04.2016 informed E.R.C. that 'Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar Primary Teacher Training Institution' and 'Pandit Iswarchandra Vidyasagar PTT & B.Ed. College' are one and the same institution differentiated by the name of course only. The appellant also submitted copies of building plan and building completion

certificate duly signed by Government Sub. Assistant Engineer of Ghatal Block and approved by Gram Pardhan who is the competent authority. Change of Land Use Certificate (CLU) issued by Block Land & Reforms Officer, Government of West Bengal is also found enclosed with the reply to S.C.N. Appeal Committee also noticed that the appellant institution was got inspected by E.R.C. and the V.T. report dated 08.03.2016 is quite favourable for grant of recognition. In case E.R.C. had any doubt or suspicion pertaining to land documents, it should have been got clarified before inspection.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee after going through the relevant land documents does not consider that land documents should be modified to include the name of particular course so long as courses pertain to teacher education managed by the same society/Trust on same piece/s of land.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee decided to remand back the case to E.R.C. for further processing of the application.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. for further processing of the application.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT and B.Ed. College, Midnapore, West Bengal to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Pandit Iswar Chandra Vidyasagar PTT and B.Ed. College, Plot No. 1482/1490, Village-Marichya, PO-Dondipur, Tehsil/Taluka – Ghatal, Midnapore, West Bengal -721222.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.

50

F.No.89-361/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Abha Teachers Training Institute, Dariyapur Kafen, Muzaffarpur, Bihar dated 26/06/2016 is against the Order No. ERC/209.8.24/APP2468/B.Ed./2016/46637 dated 02/05/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the grounds that "The applicant submitted two applications simultaneously one for B.Ed. (ERCAPP2468) another for D.El.Ed. (ERCAPP2470). ii. As per submitted building plan total built up area is 2181.16 sq. mts. which is less than therequired 3000 sq. mts. stipulated for B.Ed. plus D.El.Ed. programme in the NCTE Regulation 2014. The institution submitted revised building plan which is not approved by any Govt. Engineer. In view of the above, the committee decided as under: The Committee is of the opinion that application bearing code No. ERCAPP2468 of the institution regarding recognition for B.Ed. is refused under section 14(3)(b) of NCTE Act 1993."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Shambhu Pd. Singh, Member and Sh. Satish Kumar, Secretary, Trust & Sh. Satish Kumar, Secretary, Abha Teachers Training Institute, Dariyapur Kafen, Muzaffarpur, Bihar presented the case of the appellant institution on 25/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "The institution submitted the building plan approved by Er..Ajit Kumar, Muzaffarpur, Municipal Corporation, Muzaffarpur (MMC, Muz.). Approved building plan by Assistant Engineer, MPCSD, Central Public Works Department, Muzaffarpur, Bihar was again submitted."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that appellant institution submitted a building plan alongwith its two applications for B.Ed. & D.El.Ed. course separately. The building plan was for a proposed built up area of 2181.16 sq. mtrs. The building plan was prepared by a Chartered Engineer.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee further noted that a Show Cause Notice (S.C.N.) dated 15.01.2016 was issued to appellant institution on the ground that

total built up area of 2181.16 sq. mtrs as shown in the building plan is less than the required built up area of 3000 sq. meters. Appellant institution in reply to the S.C.N. submitted another building plan with proposed built up area of 4005.35 sq. meters. The refusal order dated 2/05/2016 issued by E.R.C. thereafter was on the ground that 'revised building plan submitted on 22.02.2016 is not approved by Government Engineer.' Appeal Committee noted that revised building plan was prepared by the same authority which had prepared the earlier plan. E.R.C. while issuing S.C.N. dated 15.01.2016 did not raise any objection with regard to the plan approving authority whereas refusal is solely on the ground that revised building plan is not approved by any Government Engineer. Appellant during the course of appeal presentation stated that building plan prepared by a Chartered Engineer was approved by Village authority and is a valid building plan. During appeal presentation, appellant also presented another copy of building plan which was countersigned by Asstt. Engineer, C.P.W.D., Muzafarpur. Appeal Committee is of the opinion that in rural area where Gram Panchayat is the civic authority and no other Municipal authority exists building plan approved by Gram Panchayat are acceptable. Adequacy of built up area can be verified by the Visiting Team at the time of inspection. Ground of refusal not having been intimated to the appellant institution in the S.C.N. Appeal Committee decided to remand back the case to E.R.C. for further processing of the case.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C., Bhubaneswar for further processing of the application.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Abha Teachers Training Institute, Dariyapur Kafen, Muzaffarpur, Bihar to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Abha Teachers Training Institute 720, 721, ownership, 109, 377, Dariyapur Kafen, Muzaffarpur, Bihar – 844127.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Bihar, Patna.

51

F.No.89-362/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Abha Teachers Training Institute, Dariyapur Kafen, Muzaffarpur, Bihar dated 26.06.2016 is against the Order No. ERC/209.8.25/APP2470/D.El.Ed./2016/46636dated 02/05/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course on the grounds that "The applicant submitted two applications simultaneously one for B.Ed. (ERCAPP2468) another for D.El.Ed. (ERCAPP2470). As per submitted building plan total built up area is 2181.16 sq. mts. which is less than the required 3000 sq. mts. stipulated for B.Ed. plus D.El.Ed. programme in the NCTE Regulation 2014. The institution submitted revised building plan which is not approved by any Govt. Engineer. In view of the above, the committee decided as under: The Committee is of the opinion that application bearing code No. ERCAPP2470 of the institution regarding recognition for D.El.Ed. is refused under section 14(3)(b) of NCTE Act 1993."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Shambhu Pd. Singh, Member and Sh. Satish Kumar, Secretary, Abha Teachers Training Institute, Dariyapur Kafen, Muzaffarpur, Bihar presented the case of the appellant institution on 25/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "The institution submitted building plan approved by Er. Ajit Kumar, Muzaffarpur Municipal Corporation, Muzaffarpur (MMC, Muz.) Approved building plan by Assistant Engineer, MPCSD, Central Public Works Department, Muzaffarpur, Bihar was again submitted."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that appellant institution submitted a building plan alongwith its two applications for B.Ed. & D.El.Ed. course separately. The building plan was for a proposed built up area of 2181.16 sq. mtrs. The building plan was prepared by a Chartered Engineer.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee further noted that a Show Cause Notice (S.C.N.) dated 15.01.2016 was issued to appellant institution on the ground that total built up area of 2181.16 sq. mtrs as shown in the building plan is less than the

required built up area of 3000 sq. meters. Appellant institution in reply to the S.C.N. submitted another building plan with proposed built up area of 4005.35 sq. meters. The refusal order dated 2/05/2016 issued by E.R.C. thereafter was on the ground that 'revised building plan submitted on 22.02.2016 is not approved by Government Engineer.' Appeal Committee noted that revised building plan was prepared by the same authority which had prepared the earlier plan. E.R.C. while issuing S.C.N. dated 15.01.2016 did not raise any objection with regard to the plan approving authority whereas refusal is solely on the ground that revised building plan is not approved by any Government Engineer. Appellant during the course of appeal presentation stated that building plan prepared by a Chartered Engineer was approved by Village authority and is a valid building plan. During appeal presentation, appellant also presented another copy of building plan which was countersigned by Asstt. Engineer, C.P.W.D., Muzafarpur. Appeal Committee is of the opinion that in rural area where Gram Panchayat is the civic authority and no other Municipal authority exists building plans approved by Gram Panchayat are acceptable. Adequacy of built up area can be verified by the Visiting Team at the time of inspection. Appeal Committee decided to remand back the case to E.R.C. for further processing of the case.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C., Bhubaneswar for further processing of the application.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Abha Teachers Training Institute, Dariyapur Kafen, Muzaffarpur, Bihar to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Abha Teachers Training Institute 720, 721, ownership, 109, 377, Dariyapur Kafen, Muzaffarpur, Bihar – 844127.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Bihar, Patna.

52

F.No.89-363/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Green Valley College, Kolar Road, Shivaji Nagar, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh dated 29/06/2016 is against the Order No. WRC/APW01399/223236/254th/2016/169137 dated16/06/2016 of the Western Regional Committee, reducing "the intake to one unit of 50 students from the academic session 2016-17 of B.Ed. course."

AND WHEREAS Ms. Meena Yadav, Director, Green Valley College, Kolar Road, Shivaji Nagar, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh presented the case of the appellant institution on 25/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "Green Valley College was not given any chance to explain for the delay and no prior notice was given that their intake will be reduced to one unit. We have completed all the formalities for two units and approved staff list for sixteen staff is also submitted on 15th June, 2016. During admission process our intake reduced. Hence we have filed writ petition to "Hon'ble High Court M.P. Kindly give us a chance to explain and restore our order."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that the appellant institution was permitted to have two basic units of 50 each for B.Ed. course vide order no. WRC/APWO1399/223236/2015/148472 dated 31.05.2015 under the revised NCTE Regulations, 2014. The recognition was subject to fulfilment of revised Norms and Standards which included appointment of faculty as required under NCTE Regulations before October, 31, 2015.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee further noted that the appellant institution was further reminded by the W.R.C. through its letter no. WRC/APWO 1399/223236/246th /2016/163560, 561 dated 22.03.2016 to appoint 16 faculty members for two units of B.Ed. course. Appellant institution started the process of

appointment but could not furnish a comprehensive compliance to W.R.C. before the stipulated dated 30.05.2016. Based on the strength of appointed faculty, W.R.C. decided to reduce the intake by one unit. As appellant institution failed to appoint requisite faculty. Appeal Committee, decided to confirm the impugned order dated 16.06.2016 which reduced the intake for B.Ed. course from 2 units to one unit.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to confirm the impugned order dated 16.06.2016 reducing the intake for B.Ed. course from 2 to one unit.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby confirms the Order appealed against.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Director, Green Valley College, 101/24 B, Kolar Road, Shivaji Nagar, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh - 462016.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Western Regional Committee, Manas Bhawan, Shayamala Hills, Bhopal - 462002.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of Madhya Pradesh, Bhopal.

53

F.No.89-364/2016 Appeal/11th Meeting-2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Hans Bhawan, Wing II, 1, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg, New Delhi - 110 002

Date: 02/9/16

ORDER

WHEREAS the appeal of Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teachers Training Institute, Matkatpur, Midnapore, West Bengal dated 28/06/2016 is against the Order No. ER/7-EM-212.7.41/ERCAPP2306/(B.Ed.)/2016/46613 dated 02/05/2016 of the Eastern Regional Committee, refusing recognition for conducting B.Ed. course on the grounds that "(i) As per online application the name of the institution is "Kharagpur B.Ed. College" but sale deed of land is in the name of "Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teacher Training Institute" i.e. land is not in the name of institution. (ii) The institution comes under the category of standalone institution which is not considerable as per NCTE Regulation 2014."

AND WHEREAS Sh. Arannayak Acharya, Adm. Officer and Sh. Bishnu Pada Acharya, Secretary, Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teachers Training Institute, Matkatpur, Midnapore, West Bengal presented the case of the appellant institution on 25/07/2016. In the appeal and during personal presentation it was submitted that "The impugned order is not maintainable and sustainable in law. For that the impugned order has been passed without considering all the aspects or the matter in its true and proper perspective. The Regional Director failed to appreciate the salient important aspect that Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teachers Training is the applicant institution to be treated as composite institution and applied for 4 units of B.Ed. Course. But only clerical mistake accrues in case of the submission of application online. The name of the college is wrongly printed as Kharagpur B.Ed. College instead of Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teachers Training Institute. The learned Regional Director unfortunately treated the application for additional intake in B.Ed. College. Here he has overlooked the matter that the name of the existing B.Ed. College is Kharagpur Tribal B.Ed. Training College. So the question of the additional intake in Kharagpur B.Ed. College does not arise at all. The appellant sent also another affidavit for the correction of the clerical mistake of the name of

the college in online submission dated 19/04/2016. The inspection was held on 18/03/2016 the members of the visiting team accepted the mistake and inspected the College i.e. Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teachers Training Institute as composite institute and applied for 4 units of B.Ed. course. For that the Regional Director failed to consider the documents supplied to and relied upon by the appellant. For that the learned Regional Director ought to have considered that the Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teachers Training Institute is the applicant institution for 4 units of B.Ed. course as composite institute. All the Land documents offered are belonging to Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teachers Training Institute. All the building is also belonging to Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teachers Training Institute. The total built up area is 5127.31 sq. mts."

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that impugned order dated 02/05/2016 issued by E.R.C., Bhubaneswar is on following grounds:-

(i) The name of the institution is 'Kharagpur B.Ed. College' but sale deed of land is in the name of 'Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teacher Training Institute' i.e. land is not in the name of institution.

(ii) The institute comes under the category of standalone institution.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee noted that the name of applicant trust as mentioned in the application form is 'Kangsbati Development Employment and service Trust'. The above Trust has already been granted recognition for conducting D.El.Ed. course with the institution name as 'Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teacher Training Institute' at Plot no. 2, NH-60, Village Matkatpur, City – Kharagpur, Dist. Midnapore vide an order dated 1.03.2015 issued by E.R.C. Bhubaneswar. Appellant Trust has furnished details of already existing D.El.Ed. course in its application for B.Ed. course. The land and other building documents are therefore, in the name of existing teacher education institution which is Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teacher Training Institution. The Trust while applying for a higher course has used a different nomenclature to identify the course. The notion derived by E.R.C. that land is not in the name of applicant institution is not logical as the Trust applying for B.Ed. course is the same and it is the name which differentiates the course. The appellant institution had further informed E.R.C. vide its letter dated 1.06.2015 (22.05.2015) that prayer for composite institution by

applying for B.Ed. course is made. The second ground of refusal that institution comes under the category of standalone institution is also not justifiable as D.El.Ed. course is already being conducted by same management Trust on the same plot/Land and building. Appeal Committee, further, observed that E.R.C. Bhubaneswar has got the institution inspected and the V.T. report dated 18.03.2016 has verified that a D.El.Ed. course in being conducted at the site where proposed B.Ed. course is proposed to be conducted.

AND WHEREAS Appeal Committee is of the view that if the E.R.C. had some doubts about the ownership of land, the same should have been sorted at the initial stage and not after getting the inspection conducted. Considering all aspects of the case in totality, Appeal Committee decided to remand back the case to E.R.C. for further processing of the application.

AND WHEREAS after perusal of the Memoranda of Appeal, affidavit, documents on record and oral arguments advanced during the hearing, Appeal Committee concluded to remand back the case to E.R.C. for further processing of the application.

NOW THEREFORE, the Council hereby remands back the case of Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teachers Training Institute, Matkatpur, Midnapore, West Bengal to the ERC, NCTE, for necessary action as indicated above.

(Sanjay Awasthi)
Member Secretary

1. The Secretary, Kharagpur Tribal Primary Teachers Training Institute B.Ed. College, 4 Units Plot No. 02, 290, 295, Bastu Ownership, Matkatpur, Kharagpur, Midnapore, West Bengal – 721305.
2. The Secretary, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of School Education & Literacy, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
3. Regional Director, Eastern Regional Committee, 15, Neelkanth Nagar, Nayapalli, Bhubaneshwar - 751 012.
4. The Secretary, Education (looking after Teacher Education) Government of West Bengal, Kolkata.